Hear and Answer

Sort a different view from the writer's answer to it.

C.8.1.b "Introduce claim(s), acknowledge and distinguish opposing claim(s) and counter/refute them and organize the reasons and evidence logically."

NAME _____ DATE _____

OPPOSING CLAIM

An opposing claim states a view that differs from the writer's claim. It does not answer that view.

Some gardeners prefer gravel paths to grass paths.

REFUTATION

A refutation answers an opposing claim with a reason or a workable solution.

People may object to planting trees near sidewalks, but root guards can protect the pavement.

1 SORT

8 items

A writer argues that the school library should open during lunch: circle OPPOSING or REFUTE for each item, then choose two items and explain how you knew where each belonged.

1.	Some students say lunch is too short to eat and visit the library.	OPPOSING REFUTE
2.	Others argue that the library would be too noisy at lunch.	OPPOSING REFUTE
3.	Some say there is not enough time to eat and visit, but students could stop by only after they finish eating.	OPPOSING REFUTE
4.	Critics argue that opening the library at lunch would add work for staff.	OPPOSING REFUTE
5.	Some students worry that visiting the library would take away time with friends.	OPPOSING REFUTE
6.	Some expect lunchtime noise, but the library could keep its quiet rules in place.	OPPOSING REFUTE
7.	Some worry that a lunch crowd would be hard to manage, but a limit on visitors could keep the room from getting too full.	OPPOSING REFUTE
8.	Some argue that crowded lunch periods would make the library hard to manage.	OPPOSING REFUTE

2 PROVE IT

Explain your thinking

Pick two items from Part 1. For each one, tell how you knew where it belonged.

ITEM # _____ **HOW I KNEW** _____

ITEM # _____ **HOW I KNEW** _____

3 MAKE YOUR OWN

One of each

Write one new opposing claim and one new refutation about opening the school library during lunch.

OPPOSING _____

REFUTE _____

CHALLENGE

Write two sentences about the lunch library idea: state a new opposing claim, then refute that same claim with a specific reason or workable solution.

ANSWER KEY

Hear and Answer

GRADE 8 · C.8.1.b

PART 1 · SORT

#	ITEM	CATEGORY	WHY
1	Some students say lunch is too short to eat and visit the library.	**OPPOSING**	States an objection without answering it.
2	Others argue that the library would be too noisy at lunch.	**OPPOSING**	States a concern without responding to it.
3	Some say there is not enough time to eat and visit, but students could stop by only after they finish eating.	**REFUTE**	Answers the time objection with a workable choice.
4	Critics argue that opening the library at lunch would add work for staff.	**OPPOSING**	States an objection about staff workload without answering it.
5	Some students worry that visiting the library would take away time with friends.	**OPPOSING**	States a concern about time with friends without responding to it.
6	Some expect lunchtime noise, but the library could keep its quiet rules in place.	**REFUTE**	Answers the noise concern with a proposed solution.
7	Some worry that a lunch crowd would be hard to manage, but a limit on visitors could keep the room from getting too full.	**REFUTE**	Answers the crowd concern with a proposed limit.
8	Some argue that crowded lunch periods would make the library hard to manage.	**OPPOSING**	States an objection about crowds without answering it.

PART 2 · PROVE IT

Accept any explanation that names the deciding feature from the rule box for the chosen item.

PART 3 · MAKE YOUR OWN (SAMPLE ANSWERS)

- **OPPOSING**: Some students say the library should stay closed at lunch so the room can be cleaned.
- **REFUTE**: Some say lunch visits would leave trash behind, but a no-food rule would keep meals out of the library.

Challenge: Some worry that lunchtime library visits would leave chairs out of place. Visitors could push in their chairs before leaving, so the room would stay ready for the next class.

Items 1, 2, 4, 5, and 8 state opposing claims. Items 3, 6, and 7 refute a concern with a proposed solution.