Connect the Case

Trace how an argument moves from a claim to a workable plan.

C.9-10.1.d "Link the major sections of the text cohesively, and clarify the relationships among claim(s), counterclaims, reasons and evidence."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the main claim and counterclaims, then circle phrases that show how each paragraph connects those ideas to reasons, evidence, or a response.

A Quiet Place at Lunch

(1) At fictional Northview High, the library closes during lunch even though its tables stand empty for half the school day. The school should open the library to students who want a quiet place to work or read. In a student council survey last spring, 78 of 120 respondents said they had trouble finding a calm place to spend lunch. That result does not represent every student, but it points to a need the noisy cafeteria cannot meet. A supervised library would give students another choice without taking away anyone's lunch break.

(2) Of course, opening the library raises a practical objection: the librarian needs a lunch break, and a quiet room still requires supervision. Simply asking the librarian to stay would solve one problem by creating another. However, the school already assigns staff to supervise the gym during lunch on a rotating schedule. A similar rotation could cover the library for a six-week trial while preserving each staff member's break. During that trial, staff could record daily attendance and any disruptions. Those records would test whether the quiet space works as intended, rather than assuming that it will.

(3) Even if a rotation is possible, some students may worry that the library would become another crowded lunchroom. For that reason, the trial should limit entry to the number of available seats and keep food in the cafeteria. These rules would protect the room's purpose: a place to read, study, or rest quietly. At the end of six weeks, the school could compare attendance and disruption records before deciding whether to continue. Opening the library at lunch is worth trying because it meets a documented need while giving the school a way to check the costs and adjust the plan.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. How does the opening of paragraph 2 change the direction of the argument after paragraph 1?

2. What does “However” in paragraph 2 connect, and how does the gym example support the response?

3. How does “Even if a rotation is possible” link paragraph 3 to paragraph 2? Explain how the proposed rules address the new concern.

4. How does the final sentence bring together the original claim, the survey result, and the six-week trial?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write one paragraph of 80 to 110 words arguing for or against an optional device-free table at lunch. Include a claim, a reason supported by a concrete example or observation, a fair counterclaim with a response, and transitions that make the relationships clear.

ANSWER KEY

Connect the Case

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the main claim and counterclaims, then circle phrases that show how each paragraph connects those ideas to reasons, evidence, or a response. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How does the opening of paragraph 2 change the direction of the argument after paragraph 1?	**Paragraph 1 argues that students need a quiet lunch option. Paragraph 2 shifts to the objection that the library needs supervision and the librarian needs a break.**
2	What does "However" in paragraph 2 connect, and how does the gym example support the response?	**It connects the staffing objection to a possible solution. The gym rotation shows that the school already uses rotating lunch supervision, which it could try in the library.**
3	How does "Even if a rotation is possible" link paragraph 3 to paragraph 2? Explain how the proposed rules address the new concern.	**The phrase accepts the possible staffing solution but introduces a separate concern about crowding. A seat limit and a no-food rule would help keep the library quiet.**
4	How does the final sentence bring together the original claim, the survey result, and the six-week trial?	**It repeats the case for opening the library, ties the need to the survey, and presents the trial as a way to check whether the plan works and adjust it.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Schools should offer one optional device-free table at lunch because some students want a break from screens while they talk. Last week, I watched three friends sit together but spend most of lunch scrolling without speaking. That moment does not prove everyone wants the same lunch, so the table should be optional. Some students may argue that a separate table would make people feel excluded. To address that concern, anyone could join or leave at any time. An optional table would make conversation easier without banning phones from the cafeteria.

Accept other accurate descriptions of the paragraph links. For Part 3, look for transitions that clarify how the example supports the claim and how the response addresses the counterclaim.