Concert in the Dark

Read two accounts of one school concert.

RI.4.6 "Compare and contrast a firsthand and secondhand account of the same event or topic."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline a detail Mina saw or heard, circle a detail the reporter learned from someone else, and write a 1 beside one fact both accounts share.

When the Lights Went Out

1. **Firsthand account, by Mina:** I stood on the stage with our choir when the lights blinked out just before our last song. For a moment, I could hear only chairs creak. Then our teacher whispered, "Keep going." We sang without microphones, and I heard the audience clap along. I could barely see my friends, but their voices helped me stay on beat.

2. When we finished, the clapping grew louder. Someone in the front row called, "One more!" I felt my cheeks get warm, even though the room was cool. Our teacher raised one finger, and we sang the chorus again. The lights came back just as we bowed. I had practiced for weeks, but the part I remember most happened in the dark.

3. **Secondhand account, from the school newsletter:** The lights went out during the choir concert on Thursday. I was not at the concert, so I asked the music teacher what happened. She said a breaker had tripped. The choir sang its last song without microphones, and the audience clapped along. The custodian reset the breaker, and the lights returned before the choir left the stage. No one was hurt.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. How can you tell that Mina's account is firsthand and the reporter's account is secondhand? Give evidence from both.

2. Name one thing both accounts say happened after the lights went out.

3. What does Mina tell you about the dark room that the reporter does not? What does the reporter tell you about the outage that Mina does not?

4. How does each account describe the end of the concert differently?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Pretend you are the newsletter editor. In three sentences, explain which account you would print first, how its point of view would interest readers, and what the other account would add. Use one specific detail from each account.

ANSWER KEY

Concert in the Dark

GRADE 4 · RI.4.6

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline a detail Mina saw or heard, circle a detail the reporter learned from someone else, and write a 1 beside one fact both accounts share. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How can you tell that Mina's account is firsthand and the reporter's account is secondhand? Give evidence from both.	**Mina says she stood on the stage and heard chairs creak. The reporter says they were not at the concert and asked the music teacher what happened.**
2	Name one thing both accounts say happened after the lights went out.	**Both say the choir sang without microphones. Both also say the audience clapped along.**
3	What does Mina tell you about the dark room that the reporter does not? What does the reporter tell you about the outage that Mina does not?	**Mina says she could hear chairs creak and could barely see her friends. The reporter says a breaker had tripped.**
4	How does each account describe the end of the concert differently?	**Mina recalls the louder clapping, singing the chorus again, and the lights returning as the choir bowed. The reporter says the custodian reset the breaker, the lights returned before the choir left the stage, and no one was hurt.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

I would print Mina's account first because hearing the chairs creak puts readers on the dark stage with her. Her memory shows what the concert felt like to a singer. I would print the reporter's account next because the music teacher's explanation tells readers that a breaker had tripped.

Accept either order in Part 3 if the student explains the choice and uses an accurate detail from each account. For the marking job, students may number any fact stated in both accounts.