Safety in Two Formats

Compare how a safety message works on paper and on screen.

RI.8.7 "Evaluate the advantages and disadvantages of using print and non-print formats for presenting particular topics or ideas."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline two advantages of the pocket card, circle two advantages of the video, and write 1 beside a card disadvantage and 2 beside a video disadvantage.

A Message for Beach Visitors

1. At a beach, a rip current can carry a swimmer away from shore. A local safety group is choosing how to explain this danger to visitors. Its pocket card gives four steps: stay calm and float, swim parallel to shore if able, signal for help if you cannot swim free, and return to land after escaping the current. The card fits in a bag, needs no battery or signal, and can be reread quickly. However, still images and short sentences cannot easily show how water and a swimmer move over time.

2. The group also makes a one-minute video for its website. Moving arrows show water flowing away from the beach while a swimmer moves across the current instead of fighting straight toward shore. A voice explains each step, and captions repeat the words for viewers who cannot hear the audio or are watching without sound. Motion may make the directions easier to picture. Yet the video takes time to play, requires a working device, and may not load if a beach has weak service.

3. Neither format works best in every moment. Before a beach trip, a family with internet access could pause and replay the video to study the swimmer's path. At the beach, a visitor could pull out the card without waiting for a file to load. The group must also update its advice when local officials change a warning: a website video can be replaced for future viewers, but cards already handed out remain unchanged. For either format, clear words still matter because arrows alone cannot explain every safety step.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. A visitor is already at a beach with weak service. Why might the card work better than the video, and what would the visitor miss?

2. A family is learning the steps at home before a trip. What advantage does the video have over the card, and what is one drawback?

3. Local officials change a warning after cards have been handed out. Which format is easier to correct for future viewers, and what problem remains with the other format?

4. A viewer cannot hear the video's voice. How do captions affect the video's usefulness, and why might the card still be more useful at the beach?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

A school wants to teach new students how to sort cafeteria waste. In 4 to 5 sentences, explain one advantage and one disadvantage of both a printed sign and a short captioned video, then choose the better main format for use in the cafeteria.

ANSWER KEY

Safety in Two Formats

GRADE 8 · RI.8.7

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline two advantages of the pocket card, circle two advantages of the video, and write 1 beside a card disadvantage and 2 beside a video disadvantage. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	A visitor is already at a beach with weak service. Why might the card work better than the video, and what would the visitor miss?	**The card works without a signal and can be checked quickly, but it cannot show the swimmer and water moving as the video does.**
2	A family is learning the steps at home before a trip. What advantage does the video have over the card, and what is one drawback?	**The family can pause and replay the moving demonstration to study the swimmer's path. The video takes time to play and requires a working device.**
3	Local officials change a warning after cards have been handed out. Which format is easier to correct for future viewers, and what problem remains with the other format?	**The website video can be replaced for future viewers, but the cards already handed out still show the old advice.**
4	A viewer cannot hear the video's voice. How do captions affect the video's usefulness, and why might the card still be more useful at the beach?	**Captions let the viewer read the video's directions, but the card may be easier to use at the beach because it needs no device or signal.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

A printed sign can stay beside the bins, so students can check it while holding a tray. But a sign cannot show the steps of separating food from its wrapper as clearly as a video can. A captioned video could demonstrate each step, though students may not have a device or time to watch it in the lunch line. I would use the sign as the main format because it is available when students need to decide.

Accept other passage-supported comparisons in Part 2. For Part 3, accept either format as the main choice if the response gives a plausible advantage and disadvantage for each and connects its choice to cafeteria use.