Test the Claim

Read a school editorial and weigh its evidence.

RI.9-10.8 "Evaluate the argument, specific claims and evidence in a text, assessing the validity, reasoning, relevancy and sufficiency of the evidence; identify false statements and fallacious reasoning."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the main proposal and circle two details offered as evidence for it. Put a question mark beside two claims that need closer checking.

Open the Gym at Lunch

1. Our school should open the gym during every lunch period, starting next month. Students need a place to move when the weather keeps us indoors. Last Tuesday and Thursday, the gym was unlocked for a trial during second lunch. A student volunteer counted 31 visitors on Tuesday and 34 on Thursday; the room's posted limit is 40. Some played basketball, while others walked laps. These numbers show that the gym could serve students at second lunch. They also prove students will use it throughout the school year, no matter which lunch period they have.

2. To find out what students think, I asked 50 students leaving the basketball team's practice. Forty-two supported daily gym access, six opposed it, and two were unsure. Since every student I surveyed supports the plan, the school can expect nearly everyone to show up. The gym would need supervision, but our assistant principal said the school has not yet decided who could staff it. A few students have suggested opening the gym just twice a week until a schedule is worked out. That approach would be too slow for a school that says student wellness matters.

3. The choice is simple: open the gym at every lunch, or accept that our school does not care about students' health. On rainy days, the hallways feel crowded, and the gym offers more room to move. The school runs two lunch periods, but the trial covered only second lunch. The volunteer recorded visits each day rather than names, so a student who came both days could appear in both counts. Even so, the school should announce a daily schedule now. Waiting for more information would leave students with nothing to do indoors during lunch.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What do the two trial-day counts support, and what prediction do they not establish?

2. Which statement about the survey is false? Use the survey results to check it.

3. Why is this survey not enough to predict that nearly everyone at school will show up?

4. What is wrong with the editorial's either-or choice? Name another option mentioned in the passage.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write a brief reply proposing a way to test lunchtime gym access before setting a daily schedule. Name new evidence you would collect, explain which claim it would help test, and offer an option beyond the editorial's two choices.

Test the Claim

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the main proposal and circle two details offered as evidence for it. Put a question mark beside two claims that need closer checking. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What do the two trial-day counts support, and what prediction do they not establish?	**The counts show that students visited the gym during second lunch on two days. They do not establish that students in both lunch periods will use it throughout the year.**
2	Which statement about the survey is false? Use the survey results to check it.	**The claim that every surveyed student supports the plan is false. Six opposed it, and two were unsure.**
3	Why is this survey not enough to predict that nearly everyone at school will show up?	**All 50 students were leaving basketball practice, so their views may not represent the whole school. Supporting the plan also does not mean a student will attend.**
4	What is wrong with the editorial's either-or choice? Name another option mentioned in the passage.	**The choice ignores other ways to support student health. The school could open the gym twice a week while it works out supervision.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

I would open the gym twice a week for four weeks and count visitors during both lunch periods. Those counts would help test the claim that students will use the gym regularly, not just on two trial days. I would also record whether enough adults are available to supervise each session. A limited schedule could give students a place to move without requiring the school to promise daily access right away.

Accept other specific limits on the evidence and other workable options that the student supports with reasoning. For the survey question, students should distinguish interest among basketball players from likely attendance across the school.