

The Refill Case

Find how a writer builds an argument with reasons and evidence.

4W1 "Write an argument to support claim(s), using clear reasons and relevant evidence."

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the writer's claim, circle each reason, and number the evidence details that support the claim.

A Better Place to Refill

- ① Our school should add a water-bottle filling station near the gym. Students use the gym for PE, recess, and games, so they often need a drink. A filling station would make it easier to refill reusable bottles instead of buying single-use plastic bottles. It could help students stay ready to learn after being active during class.
- ② Last month, Ms. Lee counted the bottles left beside the gym trash can for five school days. She found 46 empty plastic bottles. In the same week, the closest water fountain stopped working twice, and students had to walk across the building for water. These facts show that students need a more dependable place to refill bottles.
- ③ Some people may worry that a filling station costs money. However, the school could ask the parent group or a local business to help pay for it. The station would reduce waste near the gym and save students time when they are thirsty. For these reasons, the principal should consider adding one this year at school.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 What is the writer's claim?

2 Name two pieces of evidence the writer uses to support the claim.

3 How do the 46 bottles and the broken fountain support the writer's claim?

4 What concern does the writer mention, and how does the writer answer it?

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Choose one change you think your school should make. Write 4 or 5 sentences that state your claim, give two reasons, include at least one piece of evidence from an observation, survey, or fact, and answer one possible concern.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline the writer's claim, circle each reason, and number the evidence details that support the claim. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What is the writer's claim?	The school should add a water-bottle filling station near the gym.
2	Name two pieces of evidence the writer uses to support the claim.	Ms. Lee found 46 empty plastic bottles beside the gym trash can. The closest water fountain stopped working twice that week.
3	How do the 46 bottles and the broken fountain support the writer's claim?	They show that plastic-bottle waste is a problem and that the current fountain is not dependable, so students need an easier place to refill bottles.
4	What concern does the writer mention, and how does the writer answer it?	The concern is that a filling station costs money. The writer says the school could ask the parent group or a local business to help pay for it.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Our school should have a 15-minute quiet reading time after lunch. It would give students a calm start before afternoon classes. It would also give students time to practice reading every day. In our class survey, 18 of 24 students said they like reading independently. Some people may think it takes too much class time, but teachers could use time already planned for reading.

Accept equivalent wording for the claim, reasons, evidence, concern, and response in the passage questions. For the open response, look for a clear school-related claim, two relevant reasons, evidence, and a response to a possible concern.