

Judge It Fairly

Use evidence to tell a supported judgment from an unsupported one.

5R9 "Use established criteria to categorize texts and make informed judgments about quality; make connections to other texts, ideas, cultural perspectives, eras and personal experiences. (RI&RL)"

NAME _____

DATE _____

EVIDENCED JUDGMENT

An evidenced judgment tells what is good, clear, useful, or effective about a text and gives a specific detail to support the idea.

The podcast is easy to follow because the host explains each new word before using it.

UNPROVEN JUDGMENT

An unproven judgment gives an opinion about a text but does not include a specific detail that supports the opinion.

That drama is perfect.

1 SORT 8 items

Circle the tag that fits each text, then choose two texts and explain which specific words show why each belongs in its category.

- | | | | |
|-----------|--|------------------|-----------------|
| 1. | The biography is well organized. Its headings divide the scientist's life into clear time periods. | EVIDENCED | UNPROVEN |
| <hr/> | | | |
| 2. | This poem is terrible. | EVIDENCED | UNPROVEN |
| <hr/> | | | |
| 3. | Everyone should read this graphic novel because it is awesome. | EVIDENCED | UNPROVEN |
| <hr/> | | | |
| 4. | The news report seems trustworthy because it names an expert and links to the original study. | EVIDENCED | UNPROVEN |
| <hr/> | | | |
| 5. | The folktale teaches an important lesson when the generous farmer shares food and later receives help. | EVIDENCED | UNPROVEN |
| <hr/> | | | |
| 6. | This website must be accurate. It has bright colors. | EVIDENCED | UNPROVEN |
| <hr/> | | | |
| 7. | The mystery builds tension by giving one clue in each chapter but hiding who left the clues. | EVIDENCED | UNPROVEN |
| <hr/> | | | |
| 8. | The history book is boring. | EVIDENCED | UNPROVEN |

2

PROVE IT

Explain your thinking

Pick two items from Part 1. For each one, tell how you knew where it belonged.

ITEM #

HOW I KNEW

ITEM #

HOW I KNEW

3

MAKE YOUR OWN

One of each

Write one new evidenced judgment and one new unproven judgment about a text.

EVIDENCED

UNPROVEN

CHALLENGE

Write a two-sentence evidenced judgment that connects a text to another text, an idea, a cultural perspective, an era, or your own experience. Include a specific detail from the text.

PART 1 • SORT

#	ITEM	CATEGORY	WHY
1	The biography is well organized. Its headings divide the scientist's life into clear time periods.	EVIDENCED	The judgment about organization is supported by a specific feature, the headings and time periods.
2	This poem is terrible.	UNPROVEN	This is an opinion with no detail from the poem.
3	Everyone should read this graphic novel because it is awesome.	UNPROVEN	Awesome is an opinion word, not a specific detail from the graphic novel.
4	The news report seems trustworthy because it names an expert and links to the original study.	EVIDENCED	The judgment is supported by checkable source details.
5	The folktale teaches an important lesson when the generous farmer shares food and later receives help.	EVIDENCED	The plot event supports the judgment about the folktale's lesson.
6	This website must be accurate. It has bright colors.	UNPROVEN	Bright colors do not prove that information is accurate.
7	The mystery builds tension by giving one clue in each chapter but hiding who left the clues.	EVIDENCED	Specific story features support the judgment about tension.
8	The history book is boring.	UNPROVEN	This opinion has no supporting detail from the book.

PART 2 • PROVE IT

Accept any explanation that names the deciding feature from the rule box for the chosen item.

PART 3 • MAKE YOUR OWN (SAMPLE ANSWERS)

- **EVIDENCED:** The guide is useful because it lists the tools needed and explains each safety step.
- **UNPROVEN:** That story is wonderful.

Challenge: The novel is meaningful because Maya worries about finding a seat at lunch, which reminded me of my first day at a new school. Her choice to invite a quiet classmate to sit with her shows that the story values kindness.

Answers: 1 EVIDENCED, 2 UNPROVEN, 3 UNPROVEN, 4 EVIDENCED, 5 EVIDENCED, 6 UNPROVEN, 7 EVIDENCED, 8 UNPROVEN.
For Part 2, accept explanations that identify a relevant text detail for evidenced judgments or identify the missing evidence for unproven judgments.