

Judge the Garden Article

Evaluate a text by using clear criteria and meaningful connections.

6R9 "Use established criteria in order to evaluate the quality of texts. Make connections to other texts, ideas, cultural perspectives, eras, and personal experiences. (RI&RL)"

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline two details the writer uses to judge the article's quality. Circle one limitation, and number one connection to another text, time period, or personal experience.

Seeds and Sources

- ① When I evaluated the article "Seeds Saved for Spring," I used four criteria: accurate information, strong evidence, clear organization, and a respectful view of people in the past. The article explains how the Wampanoag people grew corn, beans, and squash together in New England. It says the plants helped one another: corn provided a stalk, beans added nutrients to the soil, and squash leaves shaded the ground. These accurate details appear in a logical order, from planting to harvest.
- ② Still, the article is not equally strong in every way. It calls the garden method "simple," but it gives no quotation, diary entry, or research source from a Wampanoag farmer or historian. Without such evidence, readers cannot tell where the information came from. The article also focuses on what settlers learned about the crops. It barely explains why Wampanoag knowledge mattered to their own community. A fuller Indigenous perspective would make the article more respectful and complete.
- ③ The article connects to our class reading, "A Pioneer's Garden Journal," written by a settler in the 1840s. That journal describes planting corn and squash, but it does not name the Indigenous farming knowledge behind those choices. Reading both texts shows whose voice is missing from the journal. I also think about my family's small garden: we use plants and mulch to protect soil. This connection helps me see that older growing methods can still matter today.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 Which two criteria does the writer say the article meets? Give one detail that supports either criterion.

2 How does the missing source affect the article's quality?

3 What does comparing the article with "A Pioneer's Garden Journal" show about the journal?

4 How does the writer's family-garden experience help the writer think about the article's topic?

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Choose a text you have read. Write exactly four sentences, 70 to 100 words, evaluating it with two criteria, such as accurate details, evidence, organization, or representation of perspectives. Include one detail from the text and a meaningful connection to another text, idea, cultural perspective, era, or your experience.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline two details the writer uses to judge the article's quality. Circle one limitation, and number one connection to another text, time period, or personal experience. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	Which two criteria does the writer say the article meets? Give one detail that supports either criterion.	The article meets the criteria for accurate information and clear organization. Its details about the three plants are accurate, and they are presented from planting to harvest.
2	How does the missing source affect the article's quality?	Without a quotation, diary entry, or research source from a Wampanoag farmer or historian, readers cannot tell where the information came from.
3	What does comparing the article with "A Pioneer's Garden Journal" show about the journal?	The comparison shows that the journal describes planting corn and squash but leaves out the Indigenous farming knowledge behind those choices. An Indigenous voice is missing from the journal.
4	How does the writer's family-garden experience help the writer think about the article's topic?	The experience helps the writer see that older growing methods, such as using plants and mulch to protect soil, can still matter today.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

I evaluate Pam Muñoz Ryan's historical novel *Esperanza Rising* as well organized and respectful of its characters' perspectives. Esperanza's family loses its ranch in Mexico, and she later works with her mother in California during the Great Depression. These events connect to our study of migrant farmworkers and show how economic hardship changed families' lives. The novel's clear sequence and focus on Esperanza's changing viewpoint make its historical setting believable.

Accept equivalent evidence-based evaluations. For Part 3, look for two stated criteria, an accurate text detail, and a connection that helps explain the student's judgment.