

Evidence Under Shade

Evaluate claims, reasoning, and evidence in a school proposal.

8R8 "Trace and evaluate an argument and specific claims in a text, assessing whether the reasoning is valid and the evidence is relevant and sufficient and recognizing when irrelevant evidence is introduced. (RI&RL)"

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the central claim, number each piece of evidence, and circle the detail that does not help prove the claim so you can judge the argument.

A Proposal for the Lunch Patio

- ① Riverview Middle should install a shade structure over the south lunch patio next year. The cafeteria often reaches its seating limit, so many students eat outside. During one sunny April lunch, student council members counted 68 students on the patio. The city weather station recorded 31 school days above 85°F last spring. Because the patio has no trees or roof, a permanent shade structure would give regular outdoor diners protection from direct sunlight at lunch each day.
- ② The school nurse's log listed 19 visits last September and October in which students reported headaches or dizziness after outdoor PE or lunch. These records do not prove that the unshaded patio caused every problem, since exercise and dehydration may also matter. Still, they suggest that heat affects students during the school day. A shade structure would not replace water breaks, but it could reduce direct sun exposure while students eat outside during their lunch periods.
- ③ The project deserves funding before a new scoreboard, but the proposal has gaps. It gives no price for the structure, no estimate of maintenance, and no comparison with less costly options, such as umbrellas. Those missing details make the evidence insufficient to show that this choice is the best use of school money. The proposal also notes that the principal's favorite color is blue and suggests blue fabric. That fact may guide a color choice, but it does not support installing the structure.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 What is the author's central claim?

2 Is the reasoning that a shade structure would protect diners from direct sunlight valid? Explain.

3 Is the count of 68 students sufficient evidence that students regularly need the structure? Explain why or why not.

4 Which detail is irrelevant to the decision about installing a shade structure? Why is it irrelevant?

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Write exactly four sentences recommending one school improvement. State your claim, give two relevant facts and explain how each supports your claim, then name one additional piece of evidence needed before the school decides. Do not include irrelevant details.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline the central claim, number each piece of evidence, and circle the detail that does not help prove the claim so you can judge the argument. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What is the author's central claim?	Riverview Middle should install a shade structure over the south lunch patio next year.
2	Is the reasoning that a shade structure would protect diners from direct sunlight valid? Explain.	Yes. The patio has no trees or roof, so a shade structure would provide protection from direct sunlight.
3	Is the count of 68 students sufficient evidence that students regularly need the structure? Explain why or why not.	No. The count is relevant, but it was taken during only one sunny lunch, so it does not show patio use across many days.
4	Which detail is irrelevant to the decision about installing a shade structure? Why is it irrelevant?	The principal's favorite color is blue. It may help choose fabric color, but it does not show that the structure is needed or worth its cost.

PART 3 • YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Our school should add a covered bike rack near the main entrance. On rainy mornings, students leave bicycles against the gym wall, so a rack would keep bikes organized. The current rack has only ten spaces, and it is full before first period, showing that more storage is needed. The school should also compare prices and count how many students bike during different seasons before choosing a design.

Accept equivalent statements of the claim and valid explanations that distinguish relevant evidence from sufficient evidence. For Part 3, accept varied school improvements if the response has four sentences, includes two relevant supported facts, and identifies needed additional evidence without adding unrelated information.