

Claim Clash Cards

Build, trace, and test an argument together.

GRADE 8 • 8SL3

8SL3 "Delineate a speaker's argument and specific claims, evaluating for sound reasoning, and the relevance and sufficiency of the evidence; identify when irrelevant evidence is introduced."

NAME _____

DATE _____

OUR GROUND RULES Read together first

1 Speak one at a time.

2 Respond to an idea before playing a card.

3 Use reasons, examples, or observations.

4 Challenge ideas, not people.

HOW TO PLAY Teams of 3 or 4

1. Choose a Topic Card and take one Role Card each.
2. Each player shuffles a personal set of Move Cards and deals four cards.
3. One player states a position and at least one claim about the topic.
4. Take turns responding with a Move Card starter, then play that card in the middle.
5. Keep talking until every dealt card is played, then complete the reflection.

AFTER THE ROUND Check what you did

☐ I identified an overall argument and a specific claim.

☐ I checked whether evidence supported a claim.

☐ I decided whether evidence was sufficient.

☐ I identified irrelevant evidence.

TOPIC CARDS · pick one per round

TOPIC	TOPIC	TOPIC
Phones at Lunch Should students be allowed to use phones during lunch? Choose a position, then test each claim and piece of evidence your group adds.	Homework Limits Should teachers limit homework on school nights? Choose a position, then test each claim and piece of evidence your group adds.	Quiet Lunch Space Should the school offer a quiet lunch space? Choose a position, then test each claim and piece of evidence your group adds.

ROLE CARDS · one per player

ROLE	ROLE	ROLE	ROLE
Claim Mapper Keep track of the overall position and the separate claims speakers make.	Evidence Inspector Check whether the evidence is specific and sufficient for the claim.	Logic Detective Check whether the evidence actually supports the claim being made.	Relevance Ranger Point out details that do not help prove the claim.

MOVE CARDS · deal 4 to each player

MOVE CARD CLAIM MAP “The speaker's overall argument is that ____.”	MOVE CARD CLAIM MAP “A specific claim I hear is ____.”	MOVE CARD EVIDENCE CHECK “Evidence offered for that claim is ____.”	MOVE CARD EVIDENCE CHECK “The evidence is sufficient or insufficient because ____.”
MOVE CARD REASONING TEST “This evidence supports the claim because ____.”	MOVE CARD REASONING TEST “The reasoning is weak because ____.”	MOVE CARD RELEVANCE CHECK “That detail is irrelevant because ____.”	MOVE CARD RELEVANCE CHECK “A relevant piece of evidence would be ____.”

Cards last longer on thick paper.

RUNNING THE ROUNDS

Give each student a separate, shuffled copy of the eight Move Cards, and have each student use only four cards per round. Run another round with a new topic and new roles. If participation is uneven, require the quietest player to begin the next turn and ask the group to pause until that player has a chance to use a card.

WHAT A STRONG ROUND SOUNDS LIKE

Maya	The speaker's overall argument is that students should be allowed to use phones during lunch.
Noah	A specific claim I hear is that phones help students arrange rides and after-school plans.
Ava	Evidence offered for that claim is that three students at our table said they have used phones to learn about a ride change.
Leo	This evidence supports the claim because lunch happens before students leave school and need ride information.
Maya	That detail is irrelevant because colorful phone cases do not show whether phones should be allowed at lunch.

LISTEN FOR

- Clear distinction between the overall argument and individual claims
- Direct explanation of how evidence supports or fails to support a claim
- Specific judgment about whether evidence is enough
- Accurate identification of details unrelated to the claim

There are no right answers to the topic cards. Score the moves students make, not their opinions.