Claim Under Pressure

Build a thesis that is specific without promising too much.

10.6.W.2 "Students will develop a clear, concise, defensible thesis statement."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the passage's central policy claim, circle the word that keeps it from promising a certain result, and number two details that could help defend it.

Counting Lunches

1. Imagine the last ten minutes of lunch at a high school. Trays move toward the trash, but some prepared meals are still behind the counter. A cook had to decide how many meals to prepare before knowing what students would choose. Preparing too few can leave students without their preferred lunch; preparing too many can mean food is discarded. Neither outcome is solved by telling students to eat more. Our school should test a morning lunch reservation system for one month, while keeping extra meals for students who cannot reserve, because better counts could reduce waste without limiting access.

2. A reservation would not require students to pay in advance. They could mark a lunch choice during homeroom, and kitchen staff could use the totals as an early estimate rather than a final order. Some students would forget, arrive late, or change their minds, so the kitchen would still need extra meals. Staff could compare the number of reserved meals with the number actually served each day. Those records would show whether the trial helped or merely shifted the problem. Another possible trial would offer smaller first portions and allow students to ask for more.

3. Reservations also have a cost that a simple waste count might hide. A student who misses homeroom should not have to skip lunch because a form was never completed. A working system would allow a student to request a meal at the counter, and staff would need time to manage both the reservations and the extras. If the records show less discarded food but more students turned away, the trial should not continue unchanged. A limited test makes sense only if the school tracks access as carefully as it tracks leftovers.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. State the passage's central thesis in your own words. Include the proposed change and its reason.

2. Write a different, defensible thesis about lunch waste using the other possible trial named in paragraph 2.

3. A student claims, 'Reservations will eliminate all cafeteria waste.' Rewrite the claim as a defensible thesis that keeps the reservation idea.

4. Which two results would the school need to track before defending a long-term reservation policy, and why?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Choose a school policy other than cafeteria food waste. Write one sentence stating a specific, arguable thesis that proposes a realistic change and gives a reason, then write one sentence naming evidence you would need to defend it.

ANSWER KEY

Claim Under Pressure

GRADE 10 · 10.6.W.2

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the passage's central policy claim, circle the word that keeps it from promising a certain result, and number two details that could help defend it. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	State the passage's central thesis in your own words. Include the proposed change and its reason.	**The school should try morning lunch reservations for one month, with extra meals available, because advance counts might reduce waste without denying students lunch.**
2	Write a different, defensible thesis about lunch waste using the other possible trial named in paragraph 2.	**The school should test smaller first portions with optional seconds because students could take what they expect to eat while still being able to get more food.**
3	A student claims, 'Reservations will eliminate all cafeteria waste.' Rewrite the claim as a defensible thesis that keeps the reservation idea.	**A month-long reservation trial could reduce wasted meals by giving cooks an early estimate, provided extra lunches remain available for students who miss homeroom.**
4	Which two results would the school need to track before defending a long-term reservation policy, and why?	**The school should track discarded food and whether students can still get lunch. Less waste would not justify a policy that leaves more students without meals.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Our school should keep the library open for one hour after classes twice a week because students who lack a quiet place at home need time to study. To defend this claim, I would compare student requests for after-school space with the staffing and costs needed to keep the library open.

Accept varied wording when a thesis names a specific, supportable change and avoids a guaranteed outcome the passage cannot establish. For Part 3, the evidence should be relevant to both the proposed change and its reason.