After Closing Time

Compare competing proposals for library access.

11.3.R.7 "Students will evaluate how two or more texts address similar themes or topics, using textual evidence to support their claims and inferences."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Read all three texts. Underline one claim in Text A and one in Text B, then circle a detail in Text C that helps you evaluate those claims.

Should the Library Stay Open Later?

1. **Text A, a letter from the student transit coalition:** Our town library closes at 6 p.m. on Wednesdays, just as many students finish practice or arrive home from work. We propose a four-week trial that keeps the building open until 8 p.m. each Wednesday. Two employees could each move two paid hours from Wednesday afternoon shelving to the new evening shift, so the total payroll would not rise. Some books would reach the shelves later, but an open room offers students a quiet place to study and ask for help. Count evening visitors and record their reasons for coming before deciding whether to continue.

2. **Text B, a letter from library employees:** We also want students to have a place to work, but moving shelving hours is not free of consequences. Those two employees prepare books requested for Thursday pickup during the Wednesday afternoon shift. If both spend those hours on a late shift instead, some readers may arrive to find their books unavailable. The coalition is right that two paid employees could cover 6 to 8 p.m. without raising payroll, yet the plan would move a problem rather than solve it. Keep current hours while the city seeks money for a late shift that does not displace shelving.

3. **Text C, notes from the library board meeting:** The Wednesday schedule currently includes two employees assigned to shelving from 2 to 4 p.m. The library closes at 6 p.m., and board policy requires two paid employees whenever the building is open. No additional staff hours have been funded. Last month, staff recorded 31 visitors between 5 and 6 p.m. on Wednesdays. They did not count people who came after closing. Each Thursday, approximately 40 books requested by readers are scheduled for pickup. The board has not measured how many of those requests depend on Wednesday afternoon shelving.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. How do Texts A and B differ in what they prioritize for library users? Support your comparison with one detail from each text.

2. Both texts discuss moving paid hours. How does each text evaluate the same staffing plan? Cite a detail from each.

3. Which concern in each letter does Text C help you examine, and what important information does it still leave unknown?

4. Text A calls for a trial, while Text B calls for waiting. What evidence would help judge each proposed next step? Use details from both letters.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write one paragraph recommending a four-week trial or a postponement. Weigh evidence from Texts A and B, explain how your plan meets the two-employee rule without assuming new funding, and name one measure the board should track.

ANSWER KEY

After Closing Time

GRADE 11 · 11.3.R.7

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Read all three texts. Underline one claim in Text A and one in Text B, then circle a detail in Text C that helps you evaluate those claims. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How do Texts A and B differ in what they prioritize for library users? Support your comparison with one detail from each text.	**Text A prioritizes evening study space for students who arrive home late. Text B prioritizes having requested books ready for Thursday pickup.**
2	Both texts discuss moving paid hours. How does each text evaluate the same staffing plan? Cite a detail from each.	**Text A says moving two shelving hours for each of two employees would cover the late shift without raising payroll. Text B agrees about payroll but argues that losing those shelving hours could delay requested books.**
3	Which concern in each letter does Text C help you examine, and what important information does it still leave unknown?	**Text C's 31 visitors before closing gives context for A's access concern, but it does not show how many people need the library after 6 p.m. Its Thursday pickup count gives context for B's concern, but the board does not know how many pickups depend on Wednesday shelving.**
4	Text A calls for a trial, while Text B calls for waiting. What evidence would help judge each proposed next step? Use details from both letters.	**A trial could record evening visits and reasons for coming, as Text A proposes. To judge B's reason for waiting, the library should also record whether moving shelving hours delays books requested for Thursday pickup.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

I recommend a four-week trial because Text A identifies students who may need study space after 6 p.m., and Text C shows that the board has not counted people who arrive after closing. Each Wednesday, the two employees would each move their paid 2 to 4 p.m. shelving hours to 6 to 8 p.m. That provides two paid employees for the full late shift without adding staff hours. Text B warns that this change could delay requested books. The board should record both evening visits and Thursday pickups delayed by the missed shelving time before deciding whether to continue.

Accept supported comparisons that distinguish payroll cost from the effect of shifting work. For the final task, a trial must cover both evening hours with two paid employees; a postponement may keep the current schedule while funding is sought.