Light Where Needed

Trace how an informative argument supports a practical proposal.

11.3.W.2 "Students will compose informative essays, reports, or technical writing that: • objectively introduce and develop topics • include a defensible thesis • incorporate evidence (e.g., specific facts, details, charts and graphs…"

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the thesis, circle two supporting facts, box the analogy, and star a sentence that addresses a safety concern to see how each part strengthens the argument.

A Better Direction for Streetlights

1 At night, a streetlamp has a narrow assignment: make paths and nearby obstacles visible. Yet some fixtures send light sideways or upward, where it cannot illuminate the pavement. That spill can produce glare for pedestrians and brighten the sky over a neighborhood. Cities should reduce wasted light by aiming streetlamps downward and selecting brightness suited to each location, while still meeting nighttime visibility needs. The goal is not darkness. It is a more precise use of electricity and light, much as a desk lamp directs light toward a page instead of flooding an entire room.

2 A shielded fixture blocks light from traveling above the horizontal line of the lamp. Its beam can still reach a sidewalk or crossing below. This distinction matters because light directed into the sky does not directly help a person identify a curb, while light shining into someone's eyes can make nearby details harder to see. A city could compare lighting at two crossings by checking whether pedestrians can distinguish the curb and approaching vehicles from the sidewalk. Such observations would test useful visibility, rather than treating the total amount of light as the only measure of safety.

3 Better direction alone does not settle every decision. A busy intersection may need different lighting than a quiet residential path, and a blocked fixture could leave a dangerous shadow if it is installed poorly. Planners should check local lighting requirements, inspect the area after dark, and adjust placement before reducing brightness. They can also choose fixtures that limit glare without hiding steps, signs, or people. In this approach, safety remains the standard against which changes are judged; lower energy use and a less bright night sky are additional benefits, not substitutes for a visible route.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. State the passage's thesis. What condition makes the proposal more defensible than a call to reduce all lighting?

2. Identify two facts about light or fixtures from paragraph 2. Explain how they support the thesis.

3. Why does the writer discuss a poorly installed fixture in the final paragraph? Explain how this detail develops the argument.

4. What does the desk-lamp analogy clarify about the writer's proposal?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write an 85- to 110-word paragraph proposing a lighting plan for a school courtyard used after dark. Include a defensible thesis, two accurate details from the passage, a safety consideration, and an original analogy; use formal language and varied sentences.

ANSWER KEY

Light Where Needed

GRADE 11 · 11.3.W.2

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the thesis, circle two supporting facts, box the analogy, and star a sentence that addresses a safety concern to see how each part strengthens the argument. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	State the passage's thesis. What condition makes the proposal more defensible than a call to reduce all lighting?	**Cities should aim streetlamps downward and choose suitable brightness to reduce wasted light while still meeting nighttime visibility needs. The safety condition recognizes that people must be able to see routes and obstacles.**
2	Identify two facts about light or fixtures from paragraph 2. Explain how they support the thesis.	**A shield can block light above the lamp while its beam still reaches a crossing. Light shining into someone's eyes can make nearby details harder to see. Together, these facts support directing light where it helps visibility instead of allowing spill or glare.**
3	Why does the writer discuss a poorly installed fixture in the final paragraph? Explain how this detail develops the argument.	**It acknowledges that shielding can create a dangerous shadow if installed poorly. The writer then calls for inspection and adjustment, showing how the proposal can account for safety.**
4	What does the desk-lamp analogy clarify about the writer's proposal?	**It makes the idea of directing light toward a useful area concrete: streetlights should illuminate paths, just as a desk lamp illuminates a page.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

The school courtyard should use downward-facing lights near its paths rather than brighter fixtures that scatter light in every direction. A shielded fixture can send light toward the ground while blocking light above the lamp's horizontal line. Because glare can make nearby details harder to see, staff should test whether students can identify steps and other people from the paths after dark. They should also check local lighting requirements before changing brightness. Like a flashlight aimed at a trail, courtyard lighting should show where people walk, not wash the sky. This plan protects visibility while limiting wasted light.

Accept accurate paraphrases and other relevant facts from the passage. For the writing task, check that the analogy is original and that the proposal treats visibility as a requirement, not an optional benefit.