Bottles and Proof

Test claims against the evidence a school collected.

8.3.R.6 "Students will evaluate textual evidence to determine whether a claim is substantiated or unsubstantiated."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline claims about the refill station, circle details that could test each claim, and write a question mark beside any claim the evidence does not substantiate.

What Changed at Cedar Middle?

1 At Cedar Middle School, a new bottle refill station opened beside the cafeteria in April. Some students called it an instant solution to plastic waste. The eco club wanted evidence before agreeing. Members counted disposable water bottles in the cafeteria trash after lunch on five school days before the station opened. They found 120 bottles in all. On five school days after it opened, they found 45. They recorded their results in a notebook and posted the two totals by the cafeteria door.

2 The station's screen recorded 310 refills during the second five-day period, but it did not record who filled a bottle or where that bottle came from. An announcement said, "Everyone at Cedar now carries a reusable bottle." Yet the eco club's survey of 30 students found that 18 had used the station at least once and 12 had not. The club chose students who were waiting near the cafeteria, so its survey might not represent the whole school. No one counted bottles thrown away outside the cafeteria.

3 The principal proposed adding a second station, saying the first one had saved the school money and kept hundreds of bottles out of the trash. The club had not collected purchase prices, water bills, or installation costs, so it could not check the money claim. Members also noticed that the second week included a two-day eighth-grade trip, so fewer students ate lunch at school on those days. To test whether the drop lasts, the club plans to count bottles for several more weeks.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. Is the claim that fewer disposable water bottles reached the cafeteria trash during the second five-day period substantiated? Cite both counts.

2. Does the evidence substantiate the announcement that everyone at Cedar now carries a reusable bottle? Explain.

3. Is the principal's claim that the station saved the school money substantiated? What evidence is missing?

4. Do the bottle counts prove that the station caused the drop in cafeteria trash? Use another passage detail to explain.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write a new claim about the station's effect on students, different from the claims in the four questions. State whether the passage substantiates it, and explain your judgment with two specific details.

ANSWER KEY

Bottles and Proof

GRADE 8 · 8.3.R.6

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline claims about the refill station, circle details that could test each claim, and write a question mark beside any claim the evidence does not substantiate. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	Is the claim that fewer disposable water bottles reached the cafeteria trash during the second five-day period substantiated? Cite both counts.	**Yes. The club counted 120 bottles before the station opened and 45 afterward.**
2	Does the evidence substantiate the announcement that everyone at Cedar now carries a reusable bottle? Explain.	**No. The survey asked 30 students whether they had used the station, not whether everyone carried a reusable bottle. The students surveyed might not represent the whole school.**
3	Is the principal's claim that the station saved the school money substantiated? What evidence is missing?	**No. The club did not collect purchase prices, water bills, or installation costs.**
4	Do the bottle counts prove that the station caused the drop in cafeteria trash? Use another passage detail to explain.	**No. Fewer students ate at school during the second week because of a two-day eighth-grade trip, which could also have affected the count.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

The station made students drink more water during lunch. This claim is unsubstantiated. The screen recorded 310 refills, but it did not show who used the station or how much water anyone drank. The passage also gives no count of how much water students drank before the station opened.

Accept judgments that distinguish what a detail measures from what a claim asserts. For the open task, students may choose a different claim if they use two accurate passage details and explain whether those details substantiate it.