Courtyard Choices

Compare two views of a library space

8.3.R.8 "Students will compare or contrast two or more texts, providing textual evidence to support their inferences."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline one detail in each statement that shows a shared concern. Then circle each writer's proposed place for bicycle racks to compare their solutions.

What Should Change at Eastbank Library?

1 At the Eastbank Library, a narrow courtyard sits between the reading room and the sidewalk. The library board is deciding whether to keep its raised planting beds or replace half of them with bicycle racks. During a public meeting, visitors submitted short statements about the space. Two statements appear below. Both writers use the courtyard, but they notice different problems. As you read, look for details that reveal what each writer values and what each thinks the library should do next.

2 Statement A, from eighth grader Mina: After school, I stop at the courtyard before going inside to study. Last spring, I helped plant mint in one bed, and now families pause to smell it on their way to story hour. I know cyclists need somewhere to lock their bikes. Still, removing beds would shrink the only place near the library where my little brother can watch bees visit flowers. Could we put a few racks beside the sidewalk instead and leave the beds where they are?

3 Statement B, from library assistant Theo: Every afternoon, I see riders lean bicycles against the courtyard gate. When the gate swings open, a bicycle can block the path for people entering with strollers or wheelchairs. The planting beds bring neighbors together, especially when volunteers share herbs at our summer events. I do not want to remove every bed. However, placing racks along the sidewalk would make the walkway too narrow. Replacing two beds with racks would keep the gate clear while leaving room for volunteers to grow herbs.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What do both writers value about the planting beds? Support your inference with a detail from each statement.

2. How do Mina's and Theo's proposed places for racks differ? Use a detail from each statement to explain why.

3. Whose needs does each writer emphasize most? Support your comparison with evidence from both statements.

4. What concern does each writer acknowledge from the other side? Explain the difference using evidence from both statements.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write a three-sentence recommendation to the library board that proposes a compromise neither writer suggests. Use one detail from each statement to explain how your plan could address both concerns.

ANSWER KEY

Courtyard Choices

GRADE 8 · 8.3.R.8

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline one detail in each statement that shows a shared concern. Then circle each writer's proposed place for bicycle racks to compare their solutions. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What do both writers value about the planting beds? Support your inference with a detail from each statement.	**Both value the beds as a place people can enjoy plants. Mina describes her brother watching bees at the flowers, while Theo says volunteers share herbs with neighbors.**
2	How do Mina's and Theo's proposed places for racks differ? Use a detail from each statement to explain why.	**Mina proposes racks beside the sidewalk to keep the beds. Theo proposes replacing two beds because he says sidewalk racks would make the walkway too narrow.**
3	Whose needs does each writer emphasize most? Support your comparison with evidence from both statements.	**Mina emphasizes people who enjoy the garden, such as her brother watching bees. Theo emphasizes people entering the library with strollers or wheelchairs, whose path bicycles may block.**
4	What concern does each writer acknowledge from the other side? Explain the difference using evidence from both statements.	**Mina acknowledges that cyclists need a place to lock their bikes, though she wants to keep the beds. Theo acknowledges that the beds bring neighbors together, though he wants to replace two of them.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

I recommend testing wall-mounted bicycle racks inside the courtyard, away from the gate, before removing any beds. Mina says her brother watches bees at the flowers, so keeping the beds would protect that space. Theo sees bicycles block the gate for people with strollers or wheelchairs, and racks away from the entrance might clear their path.

Accept supported inferences that compare both statements, even if students choose different details. For Part 3, the proposal must differ from both writers' plans and use one relevant detail from each statement.