Before You Post

Test a schoolwide claim against the evidence behind it.

9.6.R.3 "Students will evaluate the relevance, reliability, and validity of the information gathered."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the proposed claim, number each source of information, and circle details that help you judge whether a source supports the claim.

What Can Harbor High Say About Its Water?

1. At Harbor High, a student council member is drafting a notice that says, "Every drinking fountain in our school had lead below the district's 5 parts per billion response level this October." The district replaces a fountain filter or shuts off a fountain when a test reaches that level. Harbor has 36 fountains in three wings. A maintenance log lists their locations and notes that six filters were replaced in September. The log records repairs, not test results. Before the notice goes on the school website, the council has collected several pieces of information about the fountains.

2. An independent laboratory sent the school a signed report dated October 18. Its technicians collected water from eight north-wing fountains on October 12, before anyone used them that morning. Each sample measured between 1 and 4 parts per billion of lead. The report names the eight fountains, describes its testing method, and includes a quality-control result from a blank sample. It contains no readings from the other 28 fountains. The lab tested water taken from the fountain spouts, not water after it passed through students' bottles or classroom sinks.

3. The head custodian also posted a message on October 22: "I checked all 36 fountains with color-change strips. No strip showed lead." The strip package says that a color change appears at 10 parts per billion or higher. A student poll that week asked 42 volunteers whether their fountain water tasted metallic; 39 said no. Finally, a widely shared post says "Harbor water is toxic," linking to a laboratory report dated October 2024. That report identifies water samples from Lakeside Middle School, five miles away. The council must decide which evidence belongs in its notice.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. A student wants to use the widely shared post as proof that Harbor's fountains are toxic this October. How relevant is its linked report? Use two details.

2. Which source is more reliable for precise lead readings, the October lab report or the custodian's message? Explain using a detail about each source.

3. Can the custodian's strip results establish that every fountain was below 5 parts per billion? Explain using the strip package information.

4. What is the strongest claim about Harbor's fountains that the lab report supports? Why does the proposed notice go beyond that claim?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write a three-sentence replacement notice for the school website. State what the evidence shows about lead, identify a limit of that evidence, and recommend a specific testing step before making a schoolwide claim.

ANSWER KEY

Before You Post

GRADE 9 · 9.6.R.3

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the proposed claim, number each source of information, and circle details that help you judge whether a source supports the claim. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	A student wants to use the widely shared post as proof that Harbor's fountains are toxic this October. How relevant is its linked report? Use two details.	**It is not relevant evidence for that claim. The report is from Lakeside Middle School, not Harbor High, and it is dated October 2024, not this October.**
2	Which source is more reliable for precise lead readings, the October lab report or the custodian's message? Explain using a detail about each source.	**The lab report is more reliable for precise readings because it gives measured values and describes its method and quality control. The custodian used strips that show only whether lead reaches 10 parts per billion.**
3	Can the custodian's strip results establish that every fountain was below 5 parts per billion? Explain using the strip package information.	**No. A strip could show no color change when lead is between 5 and 9 parts per billion, which would still reach or exceed the district's response level.**
4	What is the strongest claim about Harbor's fountains that the lab report supports? Why does the proposed notice go beyond that claim?	**The eight tested north-wing fountains measured 1 to 4 parts per billion on October 12. The proposed notice makes a claim about all 36 fountains, but the lab report gives no readings for the other 28.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

An independent lab found 1 to 4 parts per billion of lead in eight north-wing fountains tested on October 12, below the district's response level. Those results do not establish lead levels in the school's other 28 fountains. The school should test those fountains with a method that measures levels below 5 parts per billion before making a schoolwide claim.

Accept responses that distinguish measured lead levels from taste or strip results and limit the lab's findings to the eight sampled fountains. The replacement notice should recommend testing the remaining fountains with a method sensitive enough to assess the district's 5 parts per billion level.