A Fair Decision

Discuss options, decide fairly, and plan what happens next.

8.P.1.1.B "Apply a range of deliberative and democratic procedures to discuss, make decisions, and propose action about real-world problems in and out of school."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the two plans, circle the rules for discussion and voting, and number the proposed steps after the vote in order.

What Should Happen to Unopened Lunch Food?

1. At Brookside Middle School, unopened lunch items often land in the trash. The student council has $150 to reduce waste this month, but it cannot change cafeteria rules on its own. Maya suggests putting up clear signs that show students where to sort lunch waste. Luis proposes a supervised share shelf where students may leave sealed items for others. Several classmates worry about food safety and whether students with allergies could tell which items are safe. The council asks the cafeteria manager which foods, if any, the school may allow on a share shelf.

2. At the next meeting, the council uses a speaking round: each member has one minute to explain a view without interruption. Then members ask questions and restate a concern they heard before replying. The cafeteria manager reports that a shelf could hold only sealed, shelf-stable foods with original labels. Signs would cost $30; a small shelf and signs together would cost $150. Some members prefer signs alone because they are easier to manage. Others argue that a supervised shelf could make more food available to students.

3. After discussing both plans, members vote by secret ballot: eight choose a two-week shelf trial with signs, and five choose signs alone. The council sends its plan to the principal for approval instead of installing the shelf immediately. Its proposal asks the cafeteria manager to check the shelf each day and students to count usable items collected each week. If labels are missing or food is not sealed, staff will remove those items. At the end of the trial, the council will review the counts and safety concerns before recommending whether to continue.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. Why should the council consult the cafeteria manager before choosing a plan? Name one way the manager's answer shapes the shelf plan.

2. How do the speaking round and the rule about restating a concern help members consider both plans?

3. Which plan wins the vote, and why can the council not put it into action immediately?

4. How will the council decide whether to recommend keeping the shelf after the trial? Include one measure of results and one safety check.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Your school has $100 to improve a crowded hallway between classes. Write one paragraph that proposes two possible actions, a fair way for students to discuss and choose, a check with school staff before acting, and a way to review the result.

ANSWER KEY

A Fair Decision

GRADE 8 · 8.P.1.1.B

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the two plans, circle the rules for discussion and voting, and number the proposed steps after the vote in order. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	Why should the council consult the cafeteria manager before choosing a plan? Name one way the manager's answer shapes the shelf plan.	**The council cannot change cafeteria rules on its own. The manager says the shelf could hold only sealed, shelf-stable foods with original labels.**
2	How do the speaking round and the rule about restating a concern help members consider both plans?	**The speaking round gives each member an uninterrupted turn. Restating a concern helps members show they understand another view before replying.**
3	Which plan wins the vote, and why can the council not put it into action immediately?	**The shelf trial with signs wins, eight votes to five. The council must get the principal's approval before installing the shelf.**
4	How will the council decide whether to recommend keeping the shelf after the trial? Include one measure of results and one safety check.	**The council will review weekly counts of usable items and safety concerns, including whether items are sealed and have labels.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Our school could post direction signs for $35 or mark walking lanes with floor tape for $50. At a meeting, students should explain reasons for each option, ask questions, and vote by secret ballot. Before buying supplies, the council should ask the principal and custodian whether the chosen change is allowed and safe. After two weeks, students can count hallway backups at the same time each day and decide whether to keep or change the plan.

Accept other passage-supported explanations of how the procedures make discussion and decisions fair. For Part 3, accept feasible actions within the budget and a review method that could show whether the chosen action helps.