Shade at the Stop

Weigh evidence and perspectives in a town decision

8.P.1 "Apply critical thinking skills to address authentic civic issues. Demonstrate an understanding of the virtue of civil discourse to analyze and address real-world problems..."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline evidence about how people use the stop, circle a claim that evidence challenges, and number two different concerns the council must weigh.

A Bus Stop Decision

1 At a town meeting in Mesa Vista, students asked for shade at the bus stop outside a public clinic. On hot afternoons, riders wait beside a wide road with no shelter. The students counted riders on three weekdays and recorded whether they stood in the sun or under a nearby tree. They found that most riders chose the tree, even though it was farther from the bus sign. Their counts show how people used the space on those days, but they do not show how hot the stop is all year.

2 A clinic nurse said shade could make waiting safer for older patients. A bus driver worried that a shelter near the corner might block the view of people crossing the road. A shop owner wanted the town to plant trees instead of building a shelter, because trees could also cool the sidewalk. One speaker argued that no one uses the stop, but the students' counts showed riders there each afternoon they observed. The group agreed to check sight lines and ask riders about their needs before choosing a design.

3 The council had money for only one stop this year, so members could not simply approve every request. They planned a public comment period, then a vote on a small pilot: a removable shade canopy placed where it would not block the driver's view. Staff would record summer temperatures at the shaded and unshaded spots and collect rider feedback. If the pilot helped without creating a safety problem, the council could consider a permanent shelter. This plan leaves room to change course when new evidence appears.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. Why should the council avoid using the students' counts alone to decide whether shade is needed all year?

2. How could the nurse's and driver's concerns both shape where a shelter goes?

3. Which claim about stop use conflicts with the students' evidence? Explain the conflict.

4. Why does the council plan both public comment and a pilot before considering a permanent shelter?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Suppose the council cannot use a canopy or build a shelter this year. In 4 to 5 sentences, propose a different way to improve waiting at this stop, address two perspectives from the passage, name evidence you would collect, and explain how riders could help decide.

ANSWER KEY

Shade at the Stop

GRADE 8 · 8.P.1

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline evidence about how people use the stop, circle a claim that evidence challenges, and number two different concerns the council must weigh. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	Why should the council avoid using the students' counts alone to decide whether shade is needed all year?	**The students counted riders on only three weekdays. Their observations do not show conditions throughout the year.**
2	How could the nurse's and driver's concerns both shape where a shelter goes?	**The shelter should shade waiting riders while staying clear of the driver's view of people crossing.**
3	Which claim about stop use conflicts with the students' evidence? Explain the conflict.	**A speaker claimed that no one uses the stop, but students counted riders there each afternoon they observed.**
4	Why does the council plan both public comment and a pilot before considering a permanent shelter?	**Public comment lets riders share their needs. The pilot lets staff test whether shade helps without creating a safety problem.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

I would move the bus sign closer to the existing tree and mark a safe waiting area there. This could give older patients shade while keeping riders away from the corner, where the driver worries about visibility. Staff should check whether the new location is accessible and count how many riders use it on hot days. Riders could discuss the results at a public meeting and vote on whether to keep the change.

Accept other evidence-based explanations that distinguish the three-day count from year-round conditions. For Your Turn, accept a feasible alternative that addresses two passage perspectives, identifies evidence to collect, and gives riders a role in the decision.