Shade or Strategy?

Compare how two writers argue for street trees.

8.P.3.2.A "Analyze works written on the same topic and compare methods the authors use to achieve similar or different purposes."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the action each writer asks readers to take. Circle one detail or question each writer uses to make that action seem important.

Two Voices on Library Block

1 In the fictional town of Briar Glen, neighbors are debating how to make the walk to the library cooler on busy summer days. Street trees can provide shade, but young trees need water and room for roots to grow. Two residents write about the same proposed planting project. The first is a flyer meant for people who walk to the library. The second is a letter meant for the town council. Their words give you two ways to think about the proposal.

2 Text A, flyer by Maya Ortiz: Think of the last time you crossed the library block at noon. The sun beat against the sidewalk, and the bus stop offered almost no shade. Now imagine a row of trees casting cool patches across that walk. A planting day this spring could be the first step toward that change. Come to Tuesday's community meeting and ask the council to plant trees along the library block. A short walk should not feel like a trip across a parking lot.

3 Text B, letter by Daniel Reed: I support adding trees along the library block, but planting day is not the finish line. Who will water the saplings during their first dry summer? Where can their roots grow without damaging the sidewalk? Before approving new trees, the council should set aside money for watering and check each planting spot. A tree that dies or breaks the pavement will not help anyone walking to the library. Plan for care now, and the shade will have a better chance to last.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. How does each writer try to move readers toward action? Name one method each uses.

2. Which details in Text A help readers imagine the walk? How is that method different from Text B's questions?

3. How does the timing of the action each writer requests differ? Explain how each writer makes that request.

4. How do the writers use possible outcomes differently to support their requests? Give one outcome from each text.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Imagine your school wants to ask families to help care for a new tree. Write four or five sentences to the principal comparing how Text A and Text B persuade readers. Recommend one method for the school's message, and include a new, school-specific detail to show how you would use it.

ANSWER KEY

Shade or Strategy?

GRADE 8 · 8.P.3.2.A

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the action each writer asks readers to take. Circle one detail or question each writer uses to make that action seem important. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How does each writer try to move readers toward action? Name one method each uses.	**Ortiz uses a vivid picture of a hot walk and future shade to urge readers to ask for trees. Reed raises practical questions about water and roots to urge the council to plan for care.**
2	Which details in Text A help readers imagine the walk? How is that method different from Text B's questions?	**Ortiz describes the sun beating on the sidewalk and a bus stop with little shade. Reed asks who will water the trees and where their roots can grow, focusing on problems to solve rather than the experience of the walk.**
3	How does the timing of the action each writer requests differ? Explain how each writer makes that request.	**Ortiz asks readers to attend a meeting and urge planting this spring after describing the hot walk. Reed asks the council to fund watering and check planting spots before approving trees, using questions about their care.**
4	How do the writers use possible outcomes differently to support their requests? Give one outcome from each text.	**Ortiz presents future shade as a reason to plant trees. Reed warns that a tree could die or damage the sidewalk without proper planning.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Text A makes readers picture a hot walk, while Text B asks practical questions about tree care. I would use Text B's method in a message to families because it points to a task they can do. Our message could ask which families can water the new tree beside the bicycle rack each Friday. This question gives families a clear way to help.

Accept other accurate comparisons supported by details from both texts. For Part 3, look for a comparison, a justified method choice, and an original school-specific detail.