Evidence After the Fire

Trace how two sources support a historical argument.

8.P.4 "Develop a variety of evidence-based written products designed for multiple purposes. Summarize and paraphrase, integrate evidence, and cite sources to create written products, research projects..."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the writer's claim, circle facts linked to a named source, and label the opposing viewpoint and the writer's reply 1 and 2. Use your marks to trace how the argument is built.

What the Triangle Fire Changed

1 On March 25, 1911, a fire swept through the Triangle Shirtwaist Factory in New York City. Many workers were young immigrant women. The National Park Service reports that 146 people died and that some exit doors were locked (National Park Service, "Triangle Shirtwaist Factory Fire"). A locked door can turn a short escape route into a trap. These details support a claim larger than one disaster: workplace safety cannot depend only on the choices of factory owners. Public rules and inspections can help protect workers before an emergency begins.

2 Some people might object that owners understand their own buildings better than outside inspectors. Owners also have to keep businesses running, so an inspection might seem like a costly interruption. Yet the fire shows why private decisions alone are not enough: workers cannot choose a safe exit if a door is locked. The U.S. Department of Labor explains that the disaster helped spur reforms in workplace safety and fire prevention (U.S. Department of Labor, "The Triangle Shirtwaist Factory Fire"). That response suggests that the danger required changes beyond one factory.

3 The two sources serve different purposes in this argument. The National Park Service provides evidence of the human cost and the blocked escape routes. The Department of Labor describes changes that followed the fire. Together, they support a practical conclusion: public officials should check workplaces for hazards and enforce safety rules, while owners remain responsible for daily precautions. Inspections cannot erase every risk, but they can catch problems before workers must face them in a crisis. Remembering both the deaths and the reforms makes the case for prevention stronger.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. State the writer's main claim in your own words. Which National Park Service detail supports it?

2. How does the writer use the two sources for different parts of the argument?

3. What opposing viewpoint does the writer recognize, and how does the writer answer it?

4. Paraphrase the Department of Labor's finding about the fire. Add a parenthetical citation, and do not copy a full sentence from the passage.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

A museum can give more space to either the lives lost in the Triangle fire or the reforms that followed. Write 4 to 5 sentences arguing which should receive more space. Include an opposing view, your response to it, and paraphrased evidence with citations from both sources in the passage.

ANSWER KEY

Evidence After the Fire

GRADE 8 · 8.P.4

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the writer's claim, circle facts linked to a named source, and label the opposing viewpoint and the writer's reply 1 and 2. Use your marks to trace how the argument is built. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	State the writer's main claim in your own words. Which National Park Service detail supports it?	**Workplace safety needs public rules and inspections, not just owners' decisions. The National Park Service reports that some exit doors were locked.**
2	How does the writer use the two sources for different parts of the argument?	**The National Park Service supplies evidence about deaths and locked exits. The Department of Labor supplies evidence that the fire helped lead to safety reforms.**
3	What opposing viewpoint does the writer recognize, and how does the writer answer it?	**Owners may know their buildings better than inspectors and see inspections as costly. The writer responds that owners' decisions alone did not keep exits safe for workers.**
4	Paraphrase the Department of Labor's finding about the fire. Add a parenthetical citation, and do not copy a full sentence from the passage.	**The fire prompted efforts to improve fire protection and worker safety (U.S. Department of Labor).**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

A museum exhibit about the Triangle fire should give the most space to the workers' lives. The National Park Service records 146 deaths and describes locked exit doors (National Park Service). Visitors need to understand the human cost of unsafe decisions. Others might argue that the exhibit should focus mainly on reforms, and the Department of Labor describes safety changes prompted by the fire (U.S. Department of Labor). Those reforms matter, but showing whom the changes were meant to protect makes their importance easier to grasp.

Accept either museum focus if the response makes a clear claim, addresses the other focus, and uses accurate, paraphrased evidence cited to both sources. Accept equivalent source citations that clearly identify the organizations.