One Street, Two Views

Compare arguments about a proposed bus lane.

AWH.P.3.2.B "Evaluate the author's point of view, potential bias, and how authors can reach different conclusions regarding the same issue."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Number the two writers' conclusions 1 and 2, circle a phrase that shows each writer's priorities, and underline one missing piece of evidence for each argument.

Who Gets the Curb?

1. On Mercer Avenue, the city proposes replacing one curbside parking lane with a bus-only lane on weekdays. City planners say the change could make buses more dependable, but delivery vehicles would need a new place to stop. At a public meeting, two writers handed out statements about the plan. Both describe the same crowded street. A city survey conducted over two weeks in October counted 1,200 bus riders and 90 cars parked along the affected blocks on an average weekday. Those numbers describe how people use the street now, not the full effects of changing it.

2. Transit director Elena Park writes, "A bus lane gives the 1,200 daily riders a fairer share of limited road space. Buses now lose time when drivers double-park, and a clear lane could shorten those delays." Park argues that the proposal serves more people than the parking lane does. Her department would be judged partly on bus performance, which gives her a reason to emphasize travel time. She does not estimate the cost of moving delivery stops or explain whether riders would save five minutes or thirty seconds. Her claim about a clearer lane is plausible, but the survey alone cannot prove how much time buses would save.

3. Bakery owner Marco Ruiz writes, "Customers pick up cakes at our door, and flour arrives by van. If stopping moves two blocks away, carrying supplies and serving customers will be harder." Ruiz concludes that the city should keep curbside parking until it tests a delivery plan. His bakery depends on easy access, so he may give nearby businesses more weight than bus riders. He does not address how often bus delays affect workers arriving at those businesses. Neither writer invents a different street, yet each selects the effects that matter most to their role. Their arguments leave different questions unanswered.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What does Park conclude, and how might her job influence the effects she emphasizes?

2. What does Ruiz conclude? Identify one interest that may shape his view and one effect he leaves out.

3. Why do Park and Ruiz reach different conclusions about the same proposal? Compare the priorities shown in their statements.

4. Can the survey settle whether the bus lane is a good idea? Explain one limit of its numbers when evaluating the writers' claims.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Imagine a nurse who rides the bus to work and a home-care driver who visits patients on Mercer Avenue. Write one paragraph explaining how each might judge the proposed bus lane, what could shape each view, and one question you would investigate before deciding which argument is stronger.

One Street, Two Views

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Number the two writers' conclusions 1 and 2, circle a phrase that shows each writer's priorities, and underline one missing piece of evidence for each argument. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What does Park conclude, and how might her job influence the effects she emphasizes?	**Park concludes that the bus lane would serve more people. As transit director, she is judged partly on bus performance, so she emphasizes riders and travel time.**
2	What does Ruiz conclude? Identify one interest that may shape his view and one effect he leaves out.	**Ruiz wants to keep curbside parking until the city tests a delivery plan. His bakery needs nearby access, and he leaves out the effect of bus delays on workers.**
3	Why do Park and Ruiz reach different conclusions about the same proposal? Compare the priorities shown in their statements.	**Park prioritizes bus riders and possible travel-time savings, while Ruiz prioritizes access for deliveries and customers. Their roles lead them to weigh different effects.**
4	Can the survey settle whether the bus lane is a good idea? Explain one limit of its numbers when evaluating the writers' claims.	**No. The counts show current bus and parking use, but they do not show how much time buses would save or how moving delivery stops would affect businesses.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

A nurse who rides the bus might support the lane because a late bus could make it harder to arrive for a shift on time. That experience could lead the nurse to focus on travel time, even though the survey does not show how many minutes the lane would save. A home-care driver might oppose the lane if losing curb space makes it harder to stop near patients' homes. The driver's work could make nearby parking seem more important than bus service. I would investigate whether the city could provide places for essential stops without delaying buses.

Accept other conclusions if students connect each viewpoint to a stated interest and distinguish the survey's counts from effects the survey does not measure. Part 3 responses may propose different evidence to investigate.