After Five

Weigh evidence and perspectives in a town decision

MWH.P.1 "Apply critical thinking skills to address authentic civic issues. Demonstrate an understanding of the virtue of civil discourse to analyze and address real-world problems. Evaluate the impact of perspectives, civil discourse..."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline one point of agreement and one point of disagreement among the speakers. Circle a sentence that identifies a limit of the evidence, then number two steps that could help the council make a fair decision.

Should the Library Stay Open Later?

1. In the fictional town of Harbor Glen, the public library closes at 5 p.m. on weekdays. At a town forum, student Maya argues for a later closing time so teenagers can study after sports and jobs. Librarian Chen agrees that access matters but says the library cannot simply add hours without paying staff. A local shop owner prefers the town to spend its limited funds on brighter streetlights near the library. These speakers share a goal of helping residents, yet they disagree about which problem deserves money first. The council must decide whether to fund a three-month trial of two additional evening hours.

2. The council's published budget report lists $12,000 available for one small project. The library director's written estimate puts the evening trial at $9,000, while the public works office estimates $11,000 for new streetlights. Maya cites a voluntary survey: 70 of 90 respondents favor later library hours. However, the survey link appeared mainly in a student newsletter, so its results may not represent all residents. Chen offers library entry counts from the final hour of each weekday, but those counts cannot show how many people would come after 5 p.m. Each source answers a different part of the question.

3. At the forum, the moderator asks speakers to restate an opposing concern before replying, and the council posts the estimates for everyone to inspect. Maya acknowledges the streetlight concern, then proposes a trial with weekly evening entry counts and a public comment form. The shop owner asks whether new hours would bring more people onto poorly lit sidewalks, an issue the library counts alone would miss. Council members could compare the trial's use and costs with public comments before voting on permanent hours. A trial would not settle every disagreement, but it would let residents test a claim, revise their views, and take part in the decision.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What goal do Maya and the shop owner share, and where do their priorities differ?

2. Someone claims that the survey proves most Harbor Glen residents want later hours. What makes that conclusion uncertain?

3. How does Maya's response to the streetlight concern support civil discourse rather than dismissing an opposing view?

4. What could the council learn from the trial's entry counts, and what concern would those counts leave unanswered?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write a brief proposal for one additional way to gather evidence before a permanent vote. Explain whose experiences it would include, what gap in the current evidence it would address, and how council members should respond if the findings challenge their views.

After Five

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline one point of agreement and one point of disagreement among the speakers. Circle a sentence that identifies a limit of the evidence, then number two steps that could help the council make a fair decision. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What goal do Maya and the shop owner share, and where do their priorities differ?	**Both want to help residents. Maya prioritizes later library hours, while the shop owner prioritizes brighter streetlights.**
2	Someone claims that the survey proves most Harbor Glen residents want later hours. What makes that conclusion uncertain?	**The survey was voluntary and its link appeared mainly in a student newsletter, so the respondents may not represent the town as a whole.**
3	How does Maya's response to the streetlight concern support civil discourse rather than dismissing an opposing view?	**She acknowledges the concern and proposes a trial that would gather evidence before a permanent decision.**
4	What could the council learn from the trial's entry counts, and what concern would those counts leave unanswered?	**The counts could show how many people use the later hours. They would not show whether people feel safe on poorly lit sidewalks.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

The council could ask volunteers to interview residents at the bus stop and senior center, not just at the library. They could ask whether people would use later hours and whether the walk home feels safe after dark. These interviews would include people the student survey may have missed and reveal concerns that entry counts cannot measure. If the answers challenge a council member's position, that member should describe the evidence accurately and ask a follow-up question before voting.

Accept other well-supported limits of the survey and other plausible ways to gather broader or different evidence. For Part 3, look for a specific method, an identified evidence gap, and a civil response to conflicting findings.