One Street, Two Views

Compare how writers use the same evidence to reach different conclusions.

MWH.P.3.2.B "Evaluate the author's point of view, potential bias, and how authors can reach different conclusions regarding the same issue."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline each columnist's recommendation, circle the observations each uses, and number one detail that might shape each writer's point of view. Use your marks to compare how the writers interpret the trial.

A Morning Street Closure

1 In the fictional town of Bellford, the council is considering closing Cedar Street beside the high school to cars from 7:30 to 8:15 each school morning. During a six-week trial, buses used a side entrance, while students could cross Cedar Street without passing moving cars. A crossing guard reported fewer tense crossings. Some drivers instead used Oak Street, a residential road one block away, and shop owners reported delayed morning deliveries. The town did not count traffic on Oak Street or record near misses before and during the trial. Two local columnists looked at these same observations and disagreed about making the closure permanent.

2 Marisol Vega, a parent who walks her son to school, wrote in the Bellford Bulletin: "The crossing guard saw fewer tense crossings, and students no longer had to dodge cars at the school gate. Those changes matter more than a few inconvenient deliveries. The council should make the morning closure permanent." Vega acknowledged that cars moved to Oak Street but argued that the town could post a lower speed limit there. She did not discuss how much traffic moved or whether the new route made Oak Street less safe. Her daily walk gives her firsthand experience, but it also focuses her attention on the school gate.

3 Daniel Cho, who owns a shop on Cedar Street, wrote in the same paper: "The crossing guard noticed calmer mornings, but the council has pushed cars onto a residential street. Before keeping this plan, it should measure traffic on Oak Street and ask whether deliveries can arrive on time." Cho concluded that the closure should end until those questions are answered. His shop depends on morning deliveries, so delays may carry more weight for him than they do for Vega. Yet his concern about Oak Street is not just a business complaint: the town has no traffic count to settle it.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What does Vega want the council to do, and which observation does she use to support her position?

2. How do Vega and Cho interpret the shift in traffic to Oak Street differently?

3. How might each columnist's role shape what they emphasize? Name one detail each writer emphasizes.

4. How does the missing Oak Street traffic count limit your ability to evaluate both writers' recommendations?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write a 5- to 6-sentence note to the council recommending whether to keep the closure, end it, or extend the trial. Use two different observations from the passage, explain how a columnist's perspective could affect a conclusion, and identify one piece of evidence that might change your recommendation.

One Street, Two Views

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline each columnist's recommendation, circle the observations each uses, and number one detail that might shape each writer's point of view. Use your marks to compare how the writers interpret the trial. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What does Vega want the council to do, and which observation does she use to support her position?	**Vega wants a permanent morning closure. She cites the crossing guard's report of fewer tense crossings.**
2	How do Vega and Cho interpret the shift in traffic to Oak Street differently?	**Vega treats the shift as a problem the town could address with a lower speed limit. Cho sees it as a reason to end the closure until the town measures traffic there.**
3	How might each columnist's role shape what they emphasize? Name one detail each writer emphasizes.	**As a parent who walks to school, Vega emphasizes calmer crossings. As a shop owner, Cho emphasizes delivery delays, although he also raises a concern about Oak Street.**
4	How does the missing Oak Street traffic count limit your ability to evaluate both writers' recommendations?	**Without a count, readers cannot judge how large the traffic shift was. That makes it harder to assess Vega's proposed fix or whether the shift warrants ending the closure, as Cho recommends.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

I recommend extending the trial rather than making the closure permanent now. The crossing guard reported fewer tense crossings, which suggests the street may be easier for students to cross. However, some drivers shifted to residential Oak Street, where the town did not count traffic. Vega's experience walking to school may lead her to give the safer-feeling crossing more weight than the traffic shift. I would reconsider my recommendation if an Oak Street traffic count showed that the shift was small, because that would weaken one reason for delaying a permanent decision.

Accept reasoned evaluations of either columnist, including different recommendations, when students connect their claims to passage evidence. Students may discuss a writer's perspective without assuming that personal interest makes the writer's observations false.