Beyond the Label

Build a claim from sources that answer different questions.

MWH.P.4.2 "Engage in authentic research to acquire, refine, and share knowledge through written presentations and products. Develop self-generated theses or claims related to independent research and investigations using credible and relevant..."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the passage's main claim, circle each source name, and number the quotation and summaries used as evidence. Notice what each source can and cannot support.

What Makes a Monument?

(1) At Devils Tower in Wyoming, a visitor might assume a national monument is just a smaller national park. The history suggests a different claim: the monument designation gave the federal government a way to protect a place without waiting for Congress to create a park. The U.S. Congress's 1906 Antiquities Act authorized presidents to set aside federal land containing "objects of historic or scientific interest" (Antiquities Act, 1906). That quotation matters because it states the legal reason a president could act. It does not, by itself, tell us which places were chosen or how people understood them.

(2) The National Park Service's Devils Tower history identifies the site as the first national monument, proclaimed by President Theodore Roosevelt in 1906. This agency account supplies an example that the law alone cannot: a named place, a decision maker, and a date. Another National Park Service account explains that the tower has cultural and spiritual importance to several Native American tribes. That evidence makes "historic or scientific interest" an incomplete description of what the place means to people. The law and the agency histories are relevant for different reasons, so a writer should identify each source rather than pass off its words or findings as personal discoveries.

(3) For a museum visitor, the contrast with the Grand Canyon sharpens the point. According to the National Park Service's Grand Canyon history, Roosevelt made the canyon a national monument in 1908, and Congress established it as a national park in 1919. These dates support a limited conclusion: monument status can come before park status. They do not prove that every monument later becomes a park. A careful writer could use the two histories to compare decisions, but should not claim the designation alone settled questions about Indigenous connections, public access, or land management. Evidence strengthens a claim only when the claim stays within what the sources show.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. How does the quotation from the Antiquities Act support the passage's main claim, and what can it not establish on its own?

2. Why does the writer use a National Park Service history as well as the text of the law to discuss Devils Tower?

3. In your own words, summarize the Grand Canyon's change in status. Name the source so a reader can tell whose finding you used.

4. A writer claims, "Every national monument eventually becomes a national park." Why does the Grand Canyon evidence not support this claim? Write a narrower claim it does support.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write a 75 to 95 word museum label for visitors who think the law fully explains Devils Tower's value. Make your own claim, include a short quotation attributed to the Antiquities Act and a paraphrase attributed to the National Park Service account of Native connections, and explain how the two sources support your claim without copying full sentences from the passage.

Beyond the Label

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the passage's main claim, circle each source name, and number the quotation and summaries used as evidence. Notice what each source can and cannot support. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How does the quotation from the Antiquities Act support the passage's main claim, and what can it not establish on its own?	**It shows that presidents had legal authority to protect qualifying federal land. It does not show that Devils Tower was chosen or explain what the place means to people.**
2	Why does the writer use a National Park Service history as well as the text of the law to discuss Devils Tower?	**The law establishes the authority to designate monuments. The Park Service history supplies a specific example: Roosevelt proclaimed Devils Tower the first national monument in 1906.**
3	In your own words, summarize the Grand Canyon's change in status. Name the source so a reader can tell whose finding you used.	**According to the National Park Service's Grand Canyon history, Roosevelt designated the canyon a monument in 1908, and Congress made it a national park in 1919.**
4	A writer claims, "Every national monument eventually becomes a national park." Why does the Grand Canyon evidence not support this claim? Write a narrower claim it does support.	**One example cannot establish what happens to every monument. The Grand Canyon evidence supports the claim that a monument can later become a national park.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

A monument is more than the reason written into its founding law. The 1906 Antiquities Act permits protection for "objects of historic or scientific interest," a legal category that explains presidential action but not every relationship to a place. The National Park Service also reports that Devils Tower holds cultural and spiritual importance for several Native American tribes. Read together, these sources show why a visitor should ask whose knowledge a monument sign includes. A legal label can protect land while leaving important human meanings out of its description.

Accept accurate paraphrases that identify the National Park Service rather than presenting its findings as the student's own research. For the museum label, look for a distinct claim, attribution for both sources, and reasoning that does not claim the law explains every meaning of the site.