When Safety Competes

How circumstances shape views of public health decisions

OKH.P.2.2.B "Analyze complex and interacting factors that influence multiple perspectives during different historical eras and contemporary events."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Circle groups with viewpoints, underline factors that shape their views, and draw lines connecting each group to at least two factors.

Two Epidemics, Many Viewpoints

1. In September 1918, Philadelphia planned a Liberty Loan parade to raise money for the United States' war effort. Influenza was already spreading among military personnel nearby. City leaders allowed the parade to proceed on September 28, and huge crowds filled the streets. For officials, wartime fundraising and public morale competed with warnings about disease. Some physicians feared that packed sidewalks would speed infection. Residents who attended might have valued patriotic duty, needed a break from wartime worry, or not understood the risk. The parade did not create the outbreak, but crowding gave a contagious virus more chances to spread.

2. Within days, Philadelphia hospitals faced a surge of patients, and the city closed schools, theaters, and other gathering places. These measures could slow contact between people, but their costs were uneven. A shop owner might lose income while supporting a closure that protected customers. A nurse might want stronger limits because crowded wards put patients and staff at risk. A worker living paycheck to paycheck might fear both infection and lost wages. Black Philadelphians also faced racial discrimination in health care and employment, which could limit their choices during the epidemic. These pressures shaped viewpoints; disagreement did not always mean that people rejected medical advice.

3. In 2020, COVID-19 brought another struggle over public health and daily life. Philadelphia again restricted some in-person activities, but its residents faced different conditions from those of 1918. Scientists could identify the virus, and many people could share information online; false claims spread online too. Some office employees could work from home, while many grocery workers had to meet customers in person. A grocery worker might favor masks to reduce exposure yet worry about enforcing a rule against angry shoppers. A restaurant owner might support health measures but fear closing permanently. Available technology, job duties, income, and trust in information shaped these overlapping views.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. Why might city leaders and physicians have viewed the 1918 parade differently? Explain the pressures on both groups.

2. Why might a nurse and a worker living paycheck to paycheck have different views of closures, even if both feared infection?

3. How could differences in available information shape people's views of health rules in 1918 and 2020? Use a detail from each era.

4. How might a grocery worker and a restaurant owner in 2020 share a health concern but disagree about a particular rule?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Imagine a city library loses air conditioning during a heat wave, and officials consider closing it for two days. In 5 to 6 sentences, explain how a librarian, a student who relies on the library's computers, and a city official might view the closure; show how at least two factors interact for each person and name one concern all three share.

ANSWER KEY

When Safety Competes

HIGH SCHOOL · OKH.P.2.2.B

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Circle groups with viewpoints, underline factors that shape their views, and draw lines connecting each group to at least two factors. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	Why might city leaders and physicians have viewed the 1918 parade differently? Explain the pressures on both groups.	**City leaders weighed wartime fundraising and public morale against disease warnings. Physicians feared that the packed parade would speed infection.**
2	Why might a nurse and a worker living paycheck to paycheck have different views of closures, even if both feared infection?	**Crowded wards could make a nurse favor stronger limits to protect patients and staff. A worker might also want protection but fear losing wages if workplaces closed.**
3	How could differences in available information shape people's views of health rules in 1918 and 2020? Use a detail from each era.	**A 1918 parade attendee might not have understood the risk. In 2020, scientists could identify the virus, but false claims spreading online could still affect people's views.**
4	How might a grocery worker and a restaurant owner in 2020 share a health concern but disagree about a particular rule?	**Both might want to reduce infections. A grocery worker might favor a mask rule but worry about enforcing it, while a restaurant owner might support health measures but fear that a closure would put the business at risk.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

The librarian might favor closing because the heat could harm visitors and staff, but worry that hourly employees would lose pay. A student who needs the library's computers for schoolwork might oppose closing, especially if home is also hot. The city official might favor closing because the building is unsafe and repairs will take time. However, the official could worry that people who depend on the library for a cool space have nowhere nearby to go. These pressures lead each person to weigh the closure differently. All three share a concern for people's safety.

Accept other passage-supported explanations of how factors interact. For Part 3, look for distinct, plausible perspectives, two interacting factors for each person, and one shared concern.