Same Street, Different Views

Compare how two writers use the same facts to argue for different choices.

OKH.P.3.2.B "Evaluate the author's point of view, potential bias, and how authors can reach different conclusions regarding the same issue."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline each writer's conclusion, circle the facts both writers use, and number details that might shape each writer's point of view.

A Decision on Market Street

1 In the fictional city of Alder Creek, the council is considering a protected bike lane on Market Street. The plan would replace 12 curbside parking spaces with a barrier separating bicycles from moving cars. A city report lists 14 reported bicycle and car crashes on Market Street in the past two years, but does not say which changes would prevent future crashes. The council has not released a study of how shoppers travel to the street. Two residents wrote opinion columns using these same facts. Their disagreement is not about whether the numbers are real, but about what the city should do with them.

2 Maya Ortiz, who volunteers with a local cycling group, urges the council to build the lane. She calls the 14 reported bicycle and car crashes in two years a warning that the current street design puts riders at risk. In her view, losing 12 curbside parking spaces is a reasonable trade for a barrier that could give people on bikes a separate place to ride. Ortiz notes that customers might also arrive by bus or on foot, though she offers no figures showing how many do. Her volunteer work may lead her to place more weight on riders' safety than on parking access.

3 Daniel Price, who owns a cafe on Market Street, urges the council to reject the lane and try other safety measures first. He accepts that 14 reported bicycle and car crashes in two years demand attention, but argues that the report cannot show whether a barrier would prevent similar crashes. He calls the loss of 12 curbside parking spaces a risk for nearby businesses because some customers drive. Price does not provide figures showing how many customers would stop visiting. His income depends partly on cafe sales, which may lead him to emphasize parking, even while he recognizes the need to protect riders.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What conclusion does Ortiz reach, and how does she use the crash count to support it?

2. What conclusion does Price reach, and how does he use the same crash count differently?

3. How might each writer's role shape which effect of losing 12 parking spaces they emphasize?

4. Which writer's argument do you find more convincing based on the passage? What missing evidence would you seek to test that argument?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Imagine you are a Market Street bus rider writing to the council. In 70 to 95 words, offer a conclusion different from both writers' conclusions, use a fact they both cite, explain how your point of view might affect your judgment, and name evidence that could challenge it.

ANSWER KEY

Same Street, Different Views

HIGH SCHOOL · OKH.P.3.2.B

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline each writer's conclusion, circle the facts both writers use, and number details that might shape each writer's point of view. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What conclusion does Ortiz reach, and how does she use the crash count to support it?	**Ortiz wants the council to build the lane. She treats the 14 reported crashes as a warning that riders need a safer street design.**
2	What conclusion does Price reach, and how does he use the same crash count differently?	**Price wants the council to reject the lane and try other safety measures first. He says the crash count shows a problem but does not prove a barrier would prevent crashes.**
3	How might each writer's role shape which effect of losing 12 parking spaces they emphasize?	**As a cycling-group volunteer, Ortiz may give more weight to riders' safety than to parking. As a cafe owner whose income depends partly on sales, Price may give more weight to parking for customers.**
4	Which writer's argument do you find more convincing based on the passage? What missing evidence would you seek to test that argument?	**Answers vary. A student might favor Ortiz but seek evidence about whether protected lanes prevent crashes, or favor Price but seek data on how many customers use the 12 spaces.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

As a bus rider, I would ask the council to test the protected lane for six months rather than approve or reject it permanently. The 14 reported bicycle and car crashes in two years make safety urgent, but that number does not prove which design works best. I do not need one of the 12 curbside parking spaces, so I might overlook drivers' needs. If a trial showed that the barrier blocked bus stops or that crashes did not decline, I would reconsider my support for it.

For question 4, accept either writer if the student cites passage evidence and identifies evidence that could test the chosen argument. For Part 3, accept a distinct conclusion that uses a shared fact, acknowledges the bus rider's perspective, and names evidence that could challenge the conclusion.