# The Shelter Decision

Trace how evidence shapes a community decision

**PS.3.1** "Explain process involved in effective problem solving and decision making."

NAME _____ DATE _____

## 1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

**YOUR JOB** Underline the problem the committee defines, circle one fact it uses to weigh each option, and number its investigation, choice, and follow-up in the order they appear so you can trace how it reaches a decision.

### A Safer Place to Wait

1. At a neighborhood meeting, students report that the bus stop outside a community clinic has no shelter. Patients waiting for the bus sometimes stand in the road to avoid rainwater pooling on the sidewalk. The city transit committee does not begin by choosing a shelter design. It defines the problem as keeping riders dry and out of traffic while they wait. Members ask riders when crowding occurs and inspect the sidewalk during a storm. They also check who owns the land, because a shelter cannot be installed wherever the committee wishes. These steps turn a complaint into a problem the committee can investigate.

2. The committee compares three options: install a shelter at the current stop, move the stop to a covered area one block away, or repair drainage and add a bench. Riders say that moving the stop would lengthen the walk for some patients who have limited mobility. A site inspection finds enough space for a shelter, but construction would require permission from the property owner. Drainage repair would reduce puddles yet leave riders exposed to rain. The committee sets criteria: safety, access, weather protection, cost, and time. It weighs each option against those criteria rather than treating the cheapest option as automatically best.

3. After getting a written estimate and speaking with the property owner, the committee recommends a shelter at the current stop and asks the streets department to repair the drainage. The owner agrees to the installation, and the shelter's cost fits the available funds. This choice keeps the stop accessible, but puddles may remain until drainage work is complete. The committee sends its recommendation to the transit agency, which has authority to approve construction. If approved, the agency will track rider reports about safety and access for three months. If problems continue, the committee will reconsider drainage repairs and the placement of the shelter.

## 2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. Why does the committee ask riders questions and inspect the stop before comparing solutions?

2. How do riders' comments affect the committee's evaluation of moving the stop?

3. Why does drainage repair with a bench fall short of the committee's goal, even though it would reduce puddles?

4. How will the committee check its decision, and what might it reconsider if problems continue?

## 3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Your school wants to reduce food waste at lunch. Propose two actions, compare them using two criteria, and describe one kind of evidence you would collect before deciding. Choose an action and explain how you would check whether it worked.

ANSWER KEY

# The Shelter Decision



## PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the problem the committee defines, circle one fact it uses to weigh each option, and number its investigation, choice, and follow-up in the order they appear so you can trace how it reaches a decision. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

## PART 2 · ANSWERS

| # | QUESTION | ANSWER |
|---|---|---|
| 1 | Why does the committee ask riders questions and inspect the stop before comparing solutions? | **It needs evidence about crowding, sidewalk conditions, and land ownership to understand the problem and identify workable solutions.** |
| 2 | How do riders' comments affect the committee's evaluation of moving the stop? | **Moving it would lengthen the walk for some patients with limited mobility, so it scores poorly on access.** |
| 3 | Why does drainage repair with a bench fall short of the committee's goal, even though it would reduce puddles? | **It would leave riders exposed to rain, so it would not meet the weather-protection part of the goal.** |
| 4 | How will the committee check its decision, and what might it reconsider if problems continue? | **The agency will track rider reports about safety and access for three months. The committee may reconsider drainage repairs and the shelter's placement.** |

## PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

The school could offer smaller default portions with free seconds, or it could let students preselect meals. I would compare cost and whether students can get enough food. I would weigh leftovers for a week to find out how much food is wasted. Smaller portions may cost less to set up, while preselection might better match preferences but require new ordering tools. I would try smaller portions first. After a month, I would compare waste weights and ask students whether they had enough to eat.

Accept reasonable explanations grounded in the passage, including answers that identify a trade-off rather than declaring one option perfect. For Part 3, look for two distinct actions, two comparison criteria, relevant evidence, a justified choice, and a way to evaluate it.