After Five

Weigh evidence and perspectives in a local decision

USG.P.1 "Apply critical thinking skills to address authentic civic issues. Demonstrate an understanding of the virtue of civil discourse to analyze and address real-world problems. Evaluate the impact of perspectives, civil discourse..."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline two kinds of evidence, circle a claim that goes beyond the evidence, and number two moments when people respond respectfully to another perspective.

Should the Library Stay Open Later?

1. On Tuesdays, the public library in the fictional town of Mill Creek closes at 5 p.m. A group of high school students asks the town council to keep it open until 8 p.m. one night a week. Students who care for younger siblings say the later hours would give them a quiet place to study after dinner. A librarian points out that some adults working daytime shifts might also benefit. At the council meeting, everyone agrees that access to books and computers matters. They disagree about whether longer hours are the best use of the library's limited budget.

2. The students bring a survey of 60 classmates: 42 say they would use evening hours. The library director brings a cost estimate showing that one extra evening each week would require paid staff time and security. She also reports that current weekday visits are highest just after school, but those counts do not show who would come later. A council member argues that the survey proves the whole town wants evening hours. Another member challenges that claim: classmates are not a representative sample of all residents. Both the survey and the cost estimate matter, but neither alone settles the decision.

3. Rather than accuse the students of ignoring costs, the director asks what hours they need most. Students ask whether the library could shift staff hours instead of adding them. The director says that would mean closing earlier on another day, which could hurt current visitors. The council proposes a six-week trial of one evening per week, with the schedule change announced publicly. Staff would record evening visits and costs, and residents could comment at a public meeting before the council votes on a permanent schedule. A trial could reveal demand, though six weeks might not capture how use changes during school breaks.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. Why does the classmates' survey not prove that the whole town wants evening hours?

2. How do the director's cost estimate and visit counts help the council, and what can they not tell it?

3. What do the speakers agree on, and what tradeoff remains disputed?

4. How would the trial and public meeting help the council make a decision? Name one limit of the trial.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Design a strategy other than the six-week evening-hours trial to improve library access. In 5 to 6 sentences, explain who would benefit, a likely objection, how you would check one claim with evidence, and how residents would help decide.

After Five

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline two kinds of evidence, circle a claim that goes beyond the evidence, and number two moments when people respond respectfully to another perspective. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	Why does the classmates' survey not prove that the whole town wants evening hours?	**It surveys only 60 classmates, who do not represent all town residents.**
2	How do the director's cost estimate and visit counts help the council, and what can they not tell it?	**The estimate identifies added staffing and security costs, and the counts show when people currently visit. Neither shows how many people would use evening hours.**
3	What do the speakers agree on, and what tradeoff remains disputed?	**They agree that access to books and computers matters. They disagree about whether evening access is worth its cost or a possible earlier closing time.**
4	How would the trial and public meeting help the council make a decision? Name one limit of the trial.	**The trial would provide visit and cost records, while the meeting would let residents respond before a vote. Six weeks might not show how use changes during school breaks.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

The library could offer an evening book and laptop pickup station at the community center twice a month. Students with after-school responsibilities and adults with daytime jobs could use it. A council member might object that staffing the station still costs money. Before committing funds, the council could compare a written cost estimate with requests from residents across several neighborhoods. At a public hearing, residents and staff could discuss those findings and suggest changes before the council votes.

Accept other well-supported interpretations of the speakers' agreement and disagreement. For the open task, look for a distinct strategy, a relevant objection, a way to test a claim, and a role for residents in the decision.