One Street, Two Views

Compare how two writers weigh the same proposal.

USG.P.3.2.B "Evaluate the author's point of view, potential bias, and how authors can reach different conclusions regarding the same issue."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Read the three paragraphs. Underline each writer's conclusion, circle one detail each uses to support it, and number one reason each writer may see the issue differently.

A Lane on Market Street

1. In the fictional city of Harbor Point, the council is considering a bus-only lane along four blocks of Market Street from 4 to 6 p.m. on weekdays. The lane would replace curbside parking during those hours. In a guest column, bus rider Lena Ortiz supports the plan. She describes missing a job interview after her bus sat behind cars waiting to turn. Ortiz argues that a clear lane could make travel more dependable for workers whose shifts begin at fixed times. She also notes that many riders cannot choose to drive. Her experience explains her concern, but one delayed trip cannot show how often delays occur.

2. Bookstore owner Marcus Bell reaches the opposite conclusion in another guest column. He agrees that buses get stuck, but he argues that removing parking will make quick stops at local shops harder. Bell recalls two customers who said they would leave rather than circle the block for a space. He worries that a loss of customers could threaten small businesses with narrow profit margins. Bell suggests changing traffic-signal timing instead of removing parking. Because his income depends partly on nearby shoppers, he may pay special attention to their needs. Still, two customers' comments cannot establish how most shoppers would respond.

3. At the council meeting, both writers cite the same basic plan, yet they weigh its possible costs differently. Ortiz focuses on the time riders might save; Bell focuses on access to storefronts. A city staff memo says no trial of the proposed lane has been conducted and recommends collecting travel times for buses, counts of occupied parking spaces, and interviews with nearby businesses before a vote. Those measures would test parts of both arguments, though interviews alone would not prove changes in sales. Neither writer claims to know exactly what a trial would find. Their conclusions reflect different priorities, not necessarily false statements.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. How does Ortiz's experience shape her conclusion about the lane, and what is one limit of her evidence?

2. How might Bell's position as a bookstore owner shape what he emphasizes, without proving he is dishonest?

3. Both writers agree that buses get stuck. Why do they reach different conclusions about removing parking?

4. How could the staff memo's proposed evidence help evaluate one claim from each column, and what would it still not prove?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

A school board is considering moving the high school start time 30 minutes later. In four sentences, explain how a student athlete and a parent who works an early shift might reach different conclusions, give a reason for each view, and name information that could help evaluate both.

ANSWER KEY

One Street, Two Views

HIGH SCHOOL · USG.P.3.2.B

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Read the three paragraphs. Underline each writer's conclusion, circle one detail each uses to support it, and number one reason each writer may see the issue differently. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How does Ortiz's experience shape her conclusion about the lane, and what is one limit of her evidence?	**After a bus delay caused her to miss an interview, Ortiz supports a lane that might make trips more dependable. One trip does not show how often buses are delayed.**
2	How might Bell's position as a bookstore owner shape what he emphasizes, without proving he is dishonest?	**Because he depends partly on nearby shoppers, Bell emphasizes their access to parking and the possible effect on businesses. That interest does not make his account false.**
3	Both writers agree that buses get stuck. Why do they reach different conclusions about removing parking?	**Ortiz gives more weight to dependable bus trips for riders, while Bell gives more weight to shoppers' access to local businesses. They prioritize different possible effects of the same plan.**
4	How could the staff memo's proposed evidence help evaluate one claim from each column, and what would it still not prove?	**Bus travel times could test whether the lane reduces delays, as Ortiz hopes. Interviews with businesses could explore Bell's concerns, but interviews alone would not prove that sales changed.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

A student athlete might favor a later start because more time to sleep could help them feel alert in morning classes. A parent who starts work early might oppose the change because a later drop-off could conflict with their job schedule. Their different schedules help explain why they weigh the proposal differently, without making either view automatically correct. A survey of students' sleep schedules and families' morning transportation needs could help the board assess both concerns.

Accept other passage-supported explanations of each writer's priorities or possible bias. For Part 3, look for two distinct conclusions, a reason connected to each person's situation, and relevant information that could help assess both views.