Claims Under Review

Build a focused claim from sources with different strengths.

USG.P.4.2.A "Develop self-generated theses or claims related to independent research and investigations using credible and relevant sources."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the proposed action, circle each source used to support it, and number two limits on what the sources can prove.

Should the Library Stay Open Later?

1. In the fictional town of Alder Bay, the East Branch library has become a topic at council meetings. Students who take part in after-school activities say they need a place to work before going home. The branch's official schedule lists hours of 10 a.m. to 6 p.m. Monday through Thursday. It says nothing about the hours on other days, so it cannot support a claim about the whole week. The schedule is a strong source for current hours because the library publishes it, but it does not show who uses the building or when they arrive.

2. A student research group surveyed 80 classmates who had visited the branch at least once that semester. Of those students, 45 said they could not usually reach the branch before 6 p.m. on Monday through Thursday. The survey offers a reason to investigate later hours, not proof that most students in town want them. Students chose whether to respond, and people who never visit the branch were not surveyed. Meanwhile, a city budget memo estimates that keeping the branch open two extra hours on those four days would cost $320 per week in staffing. The memo does not predict attendance.

3. Council members now face a choice: change the schedule for a full year, try a shorter test, or keep the current hours. An investigator could argue for a Monday-through-Thursday trial ending at 8 p.m., using the library schedule to establish the present closing time and the survey to show possible demand. That argument would still need to account for the budget memo and the survey's limited reach. To judge a trial fairly, the library could record visits between 6 and 8 p.m. and compare those counts with staffing costs. A useful claim names the action, its scope, and the evidence still needed.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. Write a claim against changing the schedule for a full year right now. Support it with two details from the passage.

2. Which source best supports a claim that some students have trouble reaching the branch before 6 p.m.? What limits that source's reach?

3. Revise this claim so its scope fits the evidence: "The library should stay open until 8 p.m. every day because all teens need it."

4. A council member claims that later hours will bring enough visits to justify their cost. What evidence is missing, and how could the library collect it?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Choose a public-service issue other than library hours. In three to four sentences, state a specific, tentative claim and name two credible sources you would investigate, explaining how each would test your claim; do not invent findings.

ANSWER KEY

Claims Under Review

HIGH SCHOOL · USG.P.4.2.A

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline the proposed action, circle each source used to support it, and number two limits on what the sources can prove. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	Write a claim against changing the schedule for a full year right now. Support it with two details from the passage.	**The council should not approve a full-year change yet because the survey included only past visitors, and two extra hours on Monday through Thursday would cost an estimated $320 per week.**
2	Which source best supports a claim that some students have trouble reaching the branch before 6 p.m.? What limits that source's reach?	**The student survey reports that 45 of 80 respondents could not usually arrive before 6 p.m. on Monday through Thursday. Respondents chose to participate, and no students who had never visited the branch were surveyed.**
3	Revise this claim so its scope fits the evidence: "The library should stay open until 8 p.m. every day because all teens need it."	**The library should test closing at 8 p.m. Monday through Thursday because 45 surveyed past visitors reported difficulty arriving before 6 p.m.; it should check attendance and costs before making a permanent change.**
4	A council member claims that later hours will bring enough visits to justify their cost. What evidence is missing, and how could the library collect it?	**The passage gives no count of visits during extended hours. During a trial, the library could count visits from 6 to 8 p.m. and compare them with staffing costs.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

A town should test a Saturday morning bus trip to its public clinic if the current schedule leaves a gap in access. I would check the transit agency's published timetable to learn whether an existing trip reaches the clinic during its open hours. I would check the clinic's official Saturday hours to see whether the proposed trip would arrive when patients can be seen.

Accept claims that match the days and evidence described, including claims that favor a trial or further investigation. For Part 3, look for a specific tentative claim and two relevant, credible sources with distinct purposes.