The Stop Debate

Use public discussion and evidence to shape a community proposal.

USH.P.1.1.B "Engage in a range of deliberative and democratic processes to develop strategies to address authentic, real-world problems in community and out-of-school contexts."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline two different needs, circle two possible actions, and number three steps the group takes to make and review its decision.

A Better Place to Wait

1. At the Cedar Street bus stop, clinic visitors wait beside a busy road with no shelter. On rainy days, people arrive at appointments with wet clothes, and at dusk the stop is hard to see. A neighborhood transit advisory group invites riders, nearby shop owners, clinic staff, and teenagers who use the route to a public meeting. Before speaking, each person writes down one concern. Riders ask for shelter and better lighting. A shop owner worries that a shelter might block the storefront. The clinic staff want a clear path for people using wheelchairs. The group agrees to consider all three needs.

2. Members first compare ideas rather than voting immediately. A shelter near the curb would protect riders but could narrow the sidewalk. Moving the stop closer to the clinic entrance might keep the storefront visible, but riders would still need protection from rain. A student suggests asking the transit agency whether a transparent shelter could fit beside the clinic's existing open space. Clinic staff offer to measure the walkway, while riders record how many people use the stop at dusk. The group cannot approve construction itself, so it plans to send the agency a proposal supported by these observations.

3. At a second meeting, the group reviews the walkway measurements and riders' notes. Members agree that a shelter beside the clinic could leave the storefront clear, but they cannot yet tell whether the space meets access rules. They vote to request an agency site check and a price estimate for a transparent shelter with lighting. Two members who prefer moving the stop ask that their idea be included as a backup. The written request includes both ideas and the evidence still needed. The group sets a date to hear the agency's response, share it publicly, and reconsider its choice if needed.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What trade-off would the group need to discuss before choosing a shelter near the curb?

2. How would the walkway measurements and riders' dusk counts help the group weigh its proposal?

3. Why does the group request an agency site check instead of declaring the shelter approved?

4. How do the backup idea and public follow-up help the group respond to residents after the vote?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

A public basketball court closes before some teens finish their after-school jobs, but nearby residents worry about late noise. Write one paragraph proposing how the community could decide what to do: name two affected groups, evidence to gather, a way to discuss and decide among options, and a way to revisit the decision.

ANSWER KEY

The Stop Debate

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline two different needs, circle two possible actions, and number three steps the group takes to make and review its decision. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What trade-off would the group need to discuss before choosing a shelter near the curb?	**A curbside shelter would protect riders from rain, but it could narrow the sidewalk, making access harder.**
2	How would the walkway measurements and riders' dusk counts help the group weigh its proposal?	**The measurements would help assess whether a clear walkway is possible. The dusk counts would show how many riders might benefit from lighting.**
3	Why does the group request an agency site check instead of declaring the shelter approved?	**The group cannot approve construction, and it does not yet know whether the proposed space meets access rules.**
4	How do the backup idea and public follow-up help the group respond to residents after the vote?	**The backup preserves the views of members who preferred moving the stop. Sharing the agency's response lets residents consider new information before the group revisits its choice.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Teens who work after school and nearby residents should both help decide whether court hours should change. The parks department could ask teens when they would use the court and collect residents' reports about noise. At a public meeting, both groups could compare keeping the current hours, extending them, and trying a shorter extension. After hearing the evidence, participants could vote on a recommendation for the parks department. If the department tests new hours, it should collect feedback for one month and then hold another meeting to decide whether to keep them.

Accept other passage-supported explanations of the trade-offs, evidence, agency authority, and follow-up. For the open task, look for a process that includes affected people, evidence, discussion of options, a decision method, and a plan to revisit the outcome.