After Five

Test claims against evidence in a town debate

WG.P.1.2.C "Reinforce critical thinking by evaluating and challenging ideas and assumptions, analyzing and explaining inconsistencies in reasoning."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline two claims about evening hours, circle two details that challenge those claims, and number one place where a conclusion does not follow from its evidence.

Should the Library Close Earlier?

1. At a town meeting, council member Reed proposed closing the public library at 5 p.m. instead of 8 p.m. on weekdays. She argued, "School ends at 3 p.m., so teenagers have no reason to visit at night." Her proposal would save money on evening staffing, but she did not provide a cost estimate. The library sits beside a bus stop served by a 6:20 p.m. bus. Students on that route can get home after an evening visit. A group of residents asked whether the closing plan accounted for trips made after practices and jobs.

2. Imani, a tenth grader, described finishing soccer practice at 5:30 p.m. She sometimes uses the library's computers for half an hour before catching the 6:20 p.m. bus home. Another student works at a grocery store until 6 p.m. and sometimes studies at the library before heading home with a parent. Neither student can arrive just after school. Reed replied that a quiet library after 7 p.m. meant earlier evening hours were unnecessary. The director noted that last Tuesday, 14 people entered between 5 and 7 p.m., while only three entered after 7 p.m.

3. The library director suggested counting visits by hour for four weeks before changing the schedule. She also asked staff to record how many visitors use library computers, since not every household has reliable internet. Reed said the new closing time would affect only people who could visit earlier. She repeated that the town would save money, although she still had no estimate of the savings or the costs of staying open. A visitor count could show how often people come in, but the council also wanted to hear why they come. It postponed its vote until it could review the counts and staffing estimate.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What does Reed assume about teenagers' schedules when she cites the 3 p.m. school dismissal? Use Imani and the bus schedule to challenge her claim.

2. Why does the number of people entering after 7 p.m. not support Reed's conclusion about earlier evening hours?

3. Reed says a 5 p.m. closing would affect only people who could visit earlier. Which detail challenges that claim, and why?

4. What could the proposed visit counts and staffing estimate help the council judge? What important question would those numbers not settle on their own?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Invent a school proposal based on a questionable assumption. In four or five sentences, state the claim, give two specific facts that challenge it, explain the reasoning gap, and name evidence that could help test the proposal.

After Five

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline two claims about evening hours, circle two details that challenge those claims, and number one place where a conclusion does not follow from its evidence. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What does Reed assume about teenagers' schedules when she cites the 3 p.m. school dismissal? Use Imani and the bus schedule to challenge her claim.	**Reed assumes teens can visit soon after school and have no reason to visit later. Imani finishes practice at 5:30 p.m., visits the library, and can take the 6:20 p.m. bus home.**
2	Why does the number of people entering after 7 p.m. not support Reed's conclusion about earlier evening hours?	**Only three people entered after 7 p.m., but 14 entered between 5 and 7 p.m. A quiet later hour does not show that the earlier hours are unnecessary.**
3	Reed says a 5 p.m. closing would affect only people who could visit earlier. Which detail challenges that claim, and why?	**The student who works until 6 p.m. sometimes studies at the library afterward. That student cannot make the same visit before a 5 p.m. closing.**
4	What could the proposed visit counts and staffing estimate help the council judge? What important question would those numbers not settle on their own?	**The counts and estimate could help the council judge evening use and costs. They would not show why visitors come or how valuable computer access is to people without reliable internet at home.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

A school board member says students need no indoor waiting area before 8 a.m. because classes begin at 8 a.m. Some buses arrive at 7:15 a.m., and the school's front doors do not open until 7:50 a.m. The time classes begin does not show when students arrive or whether they need shelter. A count of arrivals before 8 a.m. and a check of where those students wait could test the proposal.

Accept other passage-based challenges that identify the assumption or reasoning gap, not just a conflicting detail. For the open task, look for an invented claim, two relevant facts, an explanation of why the reasoning fails, and evidence that could test it.