Make the Case

Using evidence to address a decision-making audience

WG.P.4.2.C "Construct presentations or products for a designated audience, using research and reasoning to enhance understanding of a topic or issue."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline two pieces of research evidence, circle two choices that make the presentation useful to the transit committee, and number one research limit 1 and one next step 2.

A Shelter Proposal for Bellport

1. In a classroom simulation, a student group prepares a three-minute presentation for the Bellport transit committee, which must decide where to place one new bus shelter. Bellport and the observations below are invented, but the choices speakers face are realistic. The group proposes the stop outside the public clinic. Before drafting slides, students ask clinic visitors when they wait for the bus and observe the stop on two weekday afternoons. They count 19 waiting riders at 3:30 p.m. on Tuesday and 22 at the same time on Thursday. Their notes show that the stop has no overhead cover.

2. The committee must weigh limited funds against rider needs, so the speakers put their observation method and counts on the first slide, not a photograph chosen for drama. Their second slide connects the evidence to a proposal: a shelter at the clinic stop could give waiting riders a place out of rain. The speakers also explain why that location deserves closer study: they saw at least 19 riders waiting at the same time on both visits. They avoid calling it the busiest stop in town, since they did not count riders at other stops.

3. To make the request useful to the committee, the final slide names a next step rather than demanding an immediate vote. The group asks transit staff to count riders at the clinic and nearby stops during morning and afternoon trips for two weeks, then compare the results with shelter costs. The students note that two afternoons cannot reveal whether mornings, weekends, or other seasons bring different crowds. They end with a specific request: if the larger study supports the choice and funding allows it, place the new shelter at the clinic stop. This conditional conclusion keeps their case persuasive without hiding uncertainty.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. Why would the committee need to see how and when the students counted riders, not just the totals?

2. How can the speakers use the two rider counts to support their proposal without claiming too much?

3. Why does the final request depend on both wider rider counts and a comparison with costs?

4. If the committee allowed only one slide, which two details from the passage would you keep? Explain how each would help the committee decide.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write an 80 to 110 word message to the student council asking it to help the transit committee gather better evidence before a shelter decision. Use two specific facts from the passage, explain why the current evidence is not enough, and propose one action the council could organize.

Make the Case

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline two pieces of research evidence, circle two choices that make the presentation useful to the transit committee, and number one research limit 1 and one next step 2. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	Why would the committee need to see how and when the students counted riders, not just the totals?	**The method and times show what the counts measure and help the committee judge how much weight to give evidence from only two afternoons.**
2	How can the speakers use the two rider counts to support their proposal without claiming too much?	**They can say that 19 and 22 riders were waiting at the clinic stop during the two observations, which makes it worth studying. They cannot call it the busiest stop without counts from other stops.**
3	Why does the final request depend on both wider rider counts and a comparison with costs?	**The committee needs to know whether the clinic stop is a strong choice compared with nearby stops and whether funding allows a shelter there.**
4	If the committee allowed only one slide, which two details from the passage would you keep? Explain how each would help the committee decide.	**Keep the counts of 19 and 22 riders to show observed use of the stop, and keep the two-afternoon observation period to show why the evidence is not yet enough for a final decision.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Student council members, our transit committee needs stronger evidence before choosing a shelter site. At the clinic stop, student observers counted 19 riders on Tuesday and 22 on Thursday at 3:30 p.m. Those counts suggest people use the stop, but two afternoons cannot show whether it is the best location all week. Our council can organize volunteers to count riders at the clinic and nearby stops during mornings and afternoons for two weeks. Record the time and location of each count, then share the results with transit staff so the committee can compare sites fairly.

Accept other evidence-based slide choices and student council actions if students explain how those choices serve the named audience. Responses should distinguish the simulated observations from proof that the clinic stop is the best site.