Library Hours Debate

Sort statements in a debate about longer library hours.

9-10.W.1.a "Introduce claim(s), distinguish the claim(s) from alternate or opposing claims, and create an organization that establishes clear relationships among claim(s), counterclaims, reasons, and evidence."

NAME _____ DATE _____

SUPPORTING REASON

A supporting reason tells why the writer's claim makes sense. For this sort, the writer wants the school library to stay open until 6 p.m.

Paving a park trail would give wheelchair users a smoother route.

OPPOSING CLAIM

An opposing claim argues for a different choice. It challenges what the writer wants.

Some neighbors argue that the park trail should stay unpaved to protect tree roots.

1 SORT

8 items

Circle REASON or OPPOSING for each statement, then in Part 2 choose one item from each category and explain how you knew.

1.	Students could use library computers to finish research after classes.	REASON	OPPOSING
2.	Later hours would give students in clubs time to borrow books.	REASON	OPPOSING
3.	The school should not extend library hours because extra staffing would cost too much.	REASON	OPPOSING
4.	A quiet study space would help students who live in noisy homes.	REASON	OPPOSING
5.	The library should keep its current closing time because no late bus runs.	REASON	OPPOSING
6.	The school should reject later library hours because it cannot supervise students then.	REASON	OPPOSING
7.	Extended hours would let students meet with classmates for projects.	REASON	OPPOSING
8.	Students waiting for rides could spend that time reading in the library.	REASON	OPPOSING

2 PROVE IT

Explain your thinking

Choose one item from each category and explain how you knew.

ITEM # _____ **HOW I KNEW** _____

ITEM # _____ **HOW I KNEW** _____

3 MAKE YOUR OWN

One of each

Write one new supporting reason and one new opposing claim about keeping the school library open until 6 p.m.

REASON _____

OPPOSING _____

CHALLENGE

Write two sentences: first state the writer's library-hours claim with a reason, then state an opposing claim with a reason.

ANSWER KEY

Library Hours Debate

HIGH SCHOOL · 9-10.W.1.a

PART 1 · SORT

#	ITEM	CATEGORY	WHY
1	Students could use library computers to finish research after classes.	**REASON**	It gives a benefit of keeping the library open later.
2	Later hours would give students in clubs time to borrow books.	**REASON**	It explains how later hours would help students.
3	The school should not extend library hours because extra staffing would cost too much.	**OPPOSING**	It argues against extending the hours.
4	A quiet study space would help students who live in noisy homes.	**REASON**	It offers a benefit of access to the library after school.
5	The library should keep its current closing time because no late bus runs.	**OPPOSING**	It argues for keeping the current hours instead.
6	The school should reject later library hours because it cannot supervise students then.	**OPPOSING**	It argues against the writer's proposed hours.
7	Extended hours would let students meet with classmates for projects.	**REASON**	It identifies a benefit of extended hours.
8	Students waiting for rides could spend that time reading in the library.	**REASON**	It explains how students could use the library during later hours.

PART 2 · PROVE IT

Task: Choose one item from each category and explain how you knew.
Accept any explanation that names the deciding feature from the rule box for the chosen item.

PART 3 · MAKE YOUR OWN (SAMPLE ANSWERS)

- **REASON**: Later hours would give students more time to ask the librarian for help finding sources.
- **OPPOSING**: The school should keep its current library hours so it can spend the money on new books instead.

Challenge: Our school library should stay open until 6 p.m. because students need a quiet place to study after class. Others argue that it should keep its current hours because paying staff for extra time would cost too much.

For Part 2, explanations should identify whether an item supports the writer's proposed hours or argues for a different choice. Accept new examples that clearly address the same library-hours debate.