Claim Check

Which claims stand on evidence?

10.3.R.5 "Students will evaluate the validity of a speaker's argument: • distinguish the kinds of evidence (e.g., logical, empirical, anecdotal) • distinguish substantiated from unsubstantiated claims • analyze rhetorical appeals (i.e., ethos..."

NAME _____ DATE _____

SUPPORTED CLAIM

A supported claim includes relevant evidence that someone could check. The evidence must actually back up what the claim says.

A stopwatch recorded a runner's time as 12.4 seconds on Monday and 12.1 seconds on Friday, so the Friday run was faster.

UNSUPPORTED CLAIM

An unsupported claim has no checkable evidence, or the evidence given does not back it up.

Purple wallpaper improves sleep because it feels magical.

1 SORT

8 items

Circle SUPPORTED or UNBACKED for each numbered claim.

1.	Our town should ban skateboards because they look annoying.	SUPPORTED	UNBACKED
2.	In a survey of 200 riders, 150 preferred the later bus, so most surveyed riders preferred it.	SUPPORTED	UNBACKED
3.	Two water tests measured the creek's nitrate level at 8 and then 3 milligrams per liter, so the measured level fell.	SUPPORTED	UNBACKED
4.	The cafeteria's soup is the healthiest lunch because its name sounds wholesome.	SUPPORTED	UNBACKED
5.	The chess club gained members: its roster lists 14 in September and 22 in October.	SUPPORTED	UNBACKED
6.	The bridge is unsafe because a stranger online called it scary.	SUPPORTED	UNBACKED
7.	A recording of the concert starts at 6:00 and ends at 7:20, so the recorded concert lasted more than an hour.	SUPPORTED	UNBACKED
8.	The garden produced more tomatoes this year: harvest logs show 38 pounds last year and 51 this year.	SUPPORTED	UNBACKED

2 PROVE IT

Explain your thinking

Choose two numbered items and explain how you knew each category.

ITEM # _____ **HOW I KNEW** _____

ITEM # _____ **HOW I KNEW** _____

3 MAKE YOUR OWN

One of each

Write one new supported claim with checkable evidence and one new unsupported claim.

SUPPORTED _____

UNBACKED _____

CHALLENGE

Choose one unsupported claim from Part 1 and rewrite it as a narrower claim backed by specific, checkable evidence.

ANSWER KEY

Claim Check

GRADE 10 · 10.3.R.5

PART 1 · SORT

#	ITEM	CATEGORY	WHY
1	Our town should ban skateboards because they look annoying.	**UNBACKED**	An opinion about how skateboards look does not support a ban.
2	In a survey of 200 riders, 150 preferred the later bus, so most surveyed riders preferred it.	**SUPPORTED**	The survey results support the limited claim about the riders surveyed.
3	Two water tests measured the creek's nitrate level at 8 and then 3 milligrams per liter, so the measured level fell.	**SUPPORTED**	The two measurements support the claim about the measured level.
4	The cafeteria's soup is the healthiest lunch because its name sounds wholesome.	**UNBACKED**	A food's name provides no evidence about its nutritional value.
5	The chess club gained members: its roster lists 14 in September and 22 in October.	**SUPPORTED**	The roster counts support the claim that membership increased.
6	The bridge is unsafe because a stranger online called it scary.	**UNBACKED**	A stranger's reaction provides no checkable evidence about the bridge's safety.
7	A recording of the concert starts at 6:00 and ends at 7:20, so the recorded concert lasted more than an hour.	**SUPPORTED**	The recording's start and end times support the claim about its length.
8	The garden produced more tomatoes this year: harvest logs show 38 pounds last year and 51 this year.	**SUPPORTED**	The harvest logs support the comparison between years.

PART 2 · PROVE IT

Task: Choose two numbered items and explain how you knew each category.
Accept any explanation that names the deciding feature from the rule box for the chosen item.

PART 3 · MAKE YOUR OWN (SAMPLE ANSWERS)

- **SUPPORTED**: A count found 18 empty seats before the second bell and 5 afterward, so fewer seats were empty afterward.
- **UNBACKED**: The school should start at noon because mornings are pointless.

Challenge: Item 4: The soup has less sodium than the pizza. This week's cafeteria nutrition labels list 480 milligrams of sodium per serving for the soup and 760 for the pizza.

For Part 2, accept explanations that identify whether relevant, checkable evidence supports the exact claim. For Part 3, a supported example must include evidence that fits its claim.