

Evidence in Concert

Synthesize guidance and a study without overstating what they show.

11.T.C.2.d "Synthesize information from a variety of credible sources used to research the answers to questions on academic and individual topics of interest. (C)"

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Read these attributed editorial summaries. Underline each source's main contribution. Circle a limit, and label the sources A, B and C in your notes.

Should a school investigate a later start?

- ① Source A: American Academy of Pediatrics, School Start Times for Adolescents (2014). Editorial summary: AAP recommends middle and high school starts at 8:30 a.m. or later. Its policy discusses adolescent sleep biology, including later sleep timing around puberty. This provides a reason for considering schedules, not a measurement of what a particular district's change would achieve. Read: <https://doi.org/10.1542/peds.2014-1697>
- ② Source B: CDC, Sleep and Health (July 2, 2024). Editorial summary: The recommended sleep duration for ages 13–18 is 8–10 hours per 24 hours. CDC discusses insufficient sleep and the role of school schedules. This gives a benchmark for evaluating sleep, not proof that every later bell meets that benchmark. CDC also cites AAP's start-time recommendation, so that repeated recommendation is not an independent new study. Read: <https://www.cdc.gov/physical-activity-education/staying-healthy/sleep.html>
- ③ Source C: Gideon P. Dunster and colleagues, Sleepmore in Seattle, Science Advances 4 (2018), eaau6200. Editorial summary: Researchers compared independent student samples at two high schools before and after a 55-minute start delay. Median school-day sleep rose from 6 hours 50 minutes to 7 hours 24 minutes. This was a before/after study, not random assignment or a guaranteed gain for every student. Read: <https://doi.org/10.1126/sciadv.aau6200>

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

- 1** How do A's policy recommendation and B's sleep-duration benchmark contribute different things to the school's decision?

- 2** Compare C's later median with B's minimum recommendation. What does that comparison add to a synthesis?

- 3** Why should the school avoid promising every student the gain reported in C?

- 4** Why is CDC's repetition of AAP's start-time recommendation different from a second independent study?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

In 160–200 words, recommend whether a school board should investigate a later start. Synthesize A, B and C by explaining at least two relationships among them. Identify each source, distinguish a recommendation from a measured result, explain one evidence limit, and name local information needed before a decision. Do more than summarize the sources one at a time.

Write your evidence synthesis

Organize around connected ideas. Keep recommendations, measurements and local assumptions distinct.

This image shows a single sheet of white paper with horizontal ruling lines. The lines are evenly spaced and run across the width of the page. There are no margins, text, or other markings on the paper.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Read these attributed editorial summaries. Underline each source's main contribution. Circle a limit, and label the sources A, B and C in your notes. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How do A's policy recommendation and B's sleep-duration benchmark contribute different things to the school's decision?	A supplies a proposed scheduling direction and biological rationale. B supplies a recommended amount of sleep against which outcomes can be assessed; a later start alone does not show that recommendation is met.
2	Compare C's later median with B's minimum recommendation. What does that comparison add to a synthesis?	The later median is 7 hours 24 minutes, still 36 minutes below 8 hours. The change is promising but does not by itself establish adequate sleep.
3	Why should the school avoid promising every student the gain reported in C?	C compares samples at two schools before and after a change. A group median and that design do not establish an identical individual benefit everywhere.
4	Why is CDC's repetition of AAP's start-time recommendation different from a second independent study?	CDC is citing AAP's recommendation. Two publications can repeat one evidence source; treating that repetition as new independent research exaggerates support.

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

The board should investigate a later start while checking whether the change would improve students' actual sleep. AAP's recommendation in A provides a biological reason to examine the schedule. CDC's sleep-duration benchmark in B adds a different test: the goal is sufficient sleep, not merely a later bell. Because B repeats AAP's recommendation, those two statements should not be counted as separate studies.

The Seattle result in C gives the proposal empirical support, yet its later median remains below B's minimum. Thus, an improvement can be useful without solving the whole problem. C also reports a group result from a before-and-after comparison, so it cannot promise an identical benefit for each student in our district.

Before changing the schedule, the board should examine current sleep patterns, bus routes and after-school responsibilities. Those local facts would help determine whether the proposal is workable and how its effects could be assessed. The three sources justify investigation, while their limits call for a decision based on local evidence as well.

Require an actual combined argument using all three sources, two explained relationships, a limit and local information. The 36-minute gap is 8:00 minus 7:24; the 34-minute reported increase is a change in medians, not an individual guarantee. Do not convert this before/after design into randomized evidence. AAP policy and CDC's citation of it are not independent experiments. Source summaries are editorial paraphrases; complete works are identified by URLs.