

Make the Case

Read an argument model and trace how evidence supports a position.

8.W.2.A.iii "Generate and organize ideas using the writing process (planning, drafting, revising, editing) to develop multi-paragraph texts. This includes: Stating and defending conclusions or positions with reasons and precise..."

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Read this fictional argument. Underline the position sentence. Mark one reason about water access and one about waste, label the bottle count E for evidence supporting the waste reason, and circle the counterclaim and response.

A Better Way to Refill

- ① Our school should add water-refill stations near the gym and cafeteria. Students often carry reusable bottles, but the nearest fountain may be down the hall or crowded between classes. Easy access to water would help students drink during long school days. It would also reduce the number of single-use plastic bottles tossed into classroom and cafeteria bins. The change could improve water access and cut waste for students who already have reusable bottles. New stations could be placed where students already gather.
- ② Last April, student council volunteers counted 436 empty plastic drink bottles in the cafeteria trash during five lunch periods. That count shows that many drinks are bought and discarded at school. Refill stations would give students a practical choice to fill bottles they already own instead. If even some students switched, fewer bottles would enter the trash. The school would need to pay for equipment and filters, but it already budgets for building repairs. A durable station could serve students for years, but staff would need to compare installation and upkeep costs before deciding whether it is a reasonable investment.

- ③ Some people may argue that existing drinking fountains make new stations unnecessary. However, ordinary fountains are difficult to use with many reusable bottles, and the crowded cafeteria fountain can slow students between classes. A station designed for bottles could improve filling access, although staff would need to test its location and capacity to see whether queues improve. The principal should ask the facilities team for costs and choose two locations before approving the project. This plan uses evidence, answers a concern, and gives the school a clear next step for action.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE Use the passage

- 1 What is the writer's position? Give two reasons the writer gives for this position.

- 2 How does the count of 436 plastic bottles support the writer's position? Explain the connection.

- 3 What counterclaim does the writer address, and how does the writer respond to it?

- 4 How does each paragraph help organize the writer's argument?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Choose one change you think your school should make. Write a two-paragraph argument totaling 90 to 110 words. It must state your position, give two reasons, include one precise observation or count, and address one counterclaim with a response. Keep a plan and first draft, then reread and write a separate revised and edited version. Record a revision and a before-and-after edit. Use supported observations or label imagined ones. Count only the final text toward the word range.

1. Plan

Name your audience, position, two reasons and an observation. Plan a job for each paragraph.

2. First draft

Write your first version in the required paragraphs. Leave a blank line between paragraphs and keep this draft visible.

[illegible]

3. Revise and edit

Reread for two supported reasons and an explained observation. Write the final two paragraphs with a position, precise detail and counterclaim response. Leave a blank line between paragraphs. Check sentence boundaries, capitals and punctuation.

4. Change record

Explain one improvement to the support or counterclaim response. Show an actual before-and-after edit.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Read this fictional argument. Underline the position sentence. Mark one reason about water access and one about waste, label the bottle count E for evidence supporting the waste reason, and circle the counterclaim and response. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What is the writer's position? Give two reasons the writer gives for this position.	The writer believes the school should add water-refill stations. Reasons include easier access to water for students and less single-use plastic bottle waste.
2	How does the count of 436 plastic bottles support the writer's position? Explain the connection.	The count shows that many plastic drink bottles are discarded at school. Refill stations could give students a way to use reusable bottles, so fewer plastic bottles might enter the trash.
3	What counterclaim does the writer address, and how does the writer respond to it?	The counterclaim is that existing drinking fountains make new stations unnecessary. The writer responds that regular fountains are hard to use with reusable bottles and can be crowded.
4	How does each paragraph help organize the writer's argument?	Paragraph 1 states the position and main reasons. Paragraph 2 adds a specific count, explains its meaning, and considers cost. Paragraph 3 addresses a counterclaim and proposes a next step.

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Plan: Audience: principal. Position: reserve a quiet library area. Paragraph 1: evidence and two reasons, focused assignments and access to reference books. Paragraph 2: explain why group tables do not meet the same need. The twelve-student count is imagined.

First draft: Our school needs a quiet library corner. Students need somewhere calm to finish work and prepare for afternoon lessons.

Some people say the library already have tables. We should reserve six seats for silence. This would be different.

Rereading: The two reasons are relevant, but I need a precise observation and an explanation of how silent seats differ from existing group tables.

Revised text: Our school should set aside one corner of the library as a quiet study area. Last Thursday, I counted twelve students trying to finish assignments in the noisy cafeteria during lunch. A quiet area would give those students a better place to read, write, and prepare for tests. It would also keep reference books nearby for students checking facts during assignments.

Some people may say the library already has tables, but the current tables are used for group work and conversation. Reserving six seats for silent work would meet a different need without removing the group tables.

Changes made: I added the twelve-student observation, access to reference books and the difference between silent work and group conversation. I corrected "the library already have tables" to "the library already has tables."

The schools, people, counts, quotes and local observations are invented classroom examples. Students must support real observations or label imagined scenarios. Require the plan, visible draft, revised two-paragraph argument of 90-110 words total and actual edit. Both reasons need explanation; the observation supports the need, and the response explains the distinct purpose of silent seats. Marking guide: position is the first sentence, water access and waste are the two reasons, 436 bottles is the waste evidence, and paragraph 3 opens with the existing-fountains counterclaim and response. A proposed station does not guarantee shorter queues or justify cost without evaluation.