

Refill, Reuse, Reason

Study how a focused argument builds and answers a counterclaim.

8.W.2 "Organization and Composition Generate and organize ideas using the writing process (planning, drafting, revising, editing) to develop multi-paragraph texts..."

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Read this fictional school argument. Underline the position sentence, circle First, In addition, However and Therefore, and number three supporting details. Use the words around each transition to explain its connection.

A Better Way to Hydrate

- ① Riverton Middle School should replace single-use plastic water bottles at events with refill stations and reusable bottles. This change could reduce waste, save money over time, and give students reliable access to water. At last spring's field day, volunteers handed out hundreds of bottles, many of which were tossed into trash cans after only a few sips. A refill station near the track would let students fill the same bottle throughout the afternoon. For these reasons, the school should begin with its largest events next year.
- ② First, refill stations can cut the clutter left after crowded events. During field day cleanup, the custodian's team collected eight full bags of plastic bottles from the track area, according to the school's event log. Fewer disposable bottles would mean fewer bags to carry, sort, and haul away. In addition, the activities director estimates that renting two stations costs less than buying bottles for three large events. The savings could help pay for sturdy, washable bottles that students could use again.
- ③ Some people may argue that refill stations create lines and require cleaning. However, event staff can place two stations at opposite ends of the track and assign adults to check them between activities. Reusable bottles also need care, but students can write their names on them and take them home after the event. Therefore, the school should test the plan at next year's field day, record the amount of trash collected, and ask students whether water was easy to reach. A careful trial can show whether the change works before the school expands it.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE Use the passage

1 What is the writer's position? Give two reasons the writer gives for this position.

2 Use one precise detail from paragraph 2 to explain how the writer supports the claim that refill stations could reduce waste.

3 What counterclaim does the writer address, and how does the writer respond to it?

4 How does the final paragraph strengthen the conclusion instead of simply repeating the position?

3 YOUR TURN Your own words

Write a formal argument of 90 to 110 words in three paragraphs that argues for a useful change at your school. State a clear position, include two reasons with precise details, address one counterclaim with a response, use transitions, and end with a concluding statement. Keep a plan and first draft, then reread and write a separate revised and edited version. Record a revision and a before-and-after edit. Use supported observations or label imagined ones. Count only the final text toward the word range.

1. Plan

Name the audience, position, two reasons and a counterclaim. Give each paragraph a purpose.

2. First draft

Write your first version in the required paragraphs. Leave a blank line between paragraphs and keep this draft visible.

This image shows a blank sheet of white paper with horizontal ruling lines. The lines are evenly spaced and run across the width of the page. There are no margins, text, or other markings on the paper.

3. Revise and edit

Reread for a clear position and two reasons with precise support. Write your final three-paragraph argument, including a counterclaim, response, transitions and conclusion. Leave a blank line between paragraphs. Check sentence boundaries, capitals and punctuation.

4. Change record

Explain one improvement to ideas or organization. Show an actual before-and-after editing correction.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Read this fictional school argument. Underline the position sentence, circle First, In addition, However and Therefore, and number three supporting details. Use the words around each transition to explain its connection. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What is the writer's position? Give two reasons the writer gives for this position.	Riverton Middle School should use refill stations and reusable bottles at events. The writer says this would reduce waste, save money over time, and give students reliable access to water.
2	Use one precise detail from paragraph 2 to explain how the writer supports the claim that refill stations could reduce waste.	The custodian's team collected eight full bags of plastic bottles from the track area after field day. This detail shows that disposable bottles created a large amount of trash that refill stations could reduce.
3	What counterclaim does the writer address, and how does the writer respond to it?	The counterclaim is that refill stations could create lines and require cleaning. The writer responds that two stations can be placed at opposite ends of the track, adults can check them, and students can label and take home reusable bottles.
4	How does the final paragraph strengthen the conclusion instead of simply repeating the position?	It proposes a careful trial at next year's field day, including recording trash and asking students about water access. This gives a practical next step for testing the plan before expanding it.

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Plan: Audience: principal. Position: create a quiet library zone. Reasons: concentration and access to reference books. Paragraphs: position and first reason; observation and second reason; counterclaim, response and conclusion. The observation is imagined.

First draft: Our school library should create a quiet study zone. First, students need fewer distractions.

A marked zone would offer space for focused work, but I have not included an example or a second reason.

Some students need phones for research. They could use other tables or ask permission for a class task. Therefore, the zone help students focus.

Rereading: The position is clear. The middle paragraph needs a precise example and a distinct second reason; I will explain access to reference books.

Revised text: Our school library should create a quiet phone-free study zone near the reference shelves. First, fewer nearby conversations and phone notifications would help students concentrate on reading and written assignments.

During lunch, three students moved to the hallway to finish a science review. A quiet zone would give them an alternative. In addition, students could use reference books without leaving their workspace.

Some students need phones for research. However, they could use other library tables or request permission for a class task. Therefore, the zone helps students focus while keeping useful resources nearby.

Changes made: I added the three-student observation and explained access to reference books as a second reason. I corrected "the zone help students" to "the zone helps students."

The schools, people, counts, quotes and local observations are invented classroom examples. Students must support real observations or label imagined scenarios. Require three visible final paragraphs, 90-110 words total, formal tone, a position, two reasons with precise support, a counterclaim response, transitions and a conclusion. Assess the plan, preserved draft and completed revision/edit. In Read and Mark, the position is the first sentence; transitions show sequence/addition/contrast/conclusion. Accept any three relevant details, such as the field-day bottles, eight-bag cleanup count, fictional rental estimate, two-station placement or trial measures. The trial tests expected benefits; the fictional estimate does not guarantee savings elsewhere.