

Shade the Argument

Analyze choices in a city council speech.

9.T.T.3 "Argumentative Techniques: Evaluate and apply argumentative techniques to enhance text's appeal to audiences or achieve specific purposes."

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Read this fictional city council speech. Underline the claim and request, circle the attributed evidence, and label a counterclaim and response. Evaluate how the writer balances persuasive language with the limits of the evidence.

A Cooler Wait for Riders

- ① Members of the Riverton City Council, please investigate shade shelters for our ten busiest bus stops. In this fictional city, these stops have benches but no roofs, leaving riders exposed to direct sun. Why should a public waiting area offer a seat but no shade? A shelter could provide relief from direct sunlight for students, workers, and other riders. That possible benefit deserves attention, even though a roof cannot make every hot-weather journey safe. Our claim is that a carefully planned shade project is worth investigating, not that shade removes all heat risk.
- ② Some residents worry about cost and crowded sidewalks. Those concerns deserve an answer based on site information. Before choosing a design, the city should check boarding clearance, accessibility, utilities, and expected costs. The CDC's "About Heat and Your Health" guidance recommends staying in shade as much as possible outdoors during high heat risk, along with breaks and other cooling precautions. The guidance supports offering shade, but it does not establish whether a particular shelter will fit or what it will cost. Those are local questions the council must investigate.

- ③ Please request a site and cost report this fall, then consider a small pilot at locations that meet access requirements. Publish the findings and invite riders to comment on the proposed locations. If a pilot is approved, record use, rider feedback, and maintenance needs before deciding whether to expand. A rider carrying groceries should not have to wonder whether a basic waiting-area improvement was ever considered. Let us make a practical next decision while being honest about what we still need to learn.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

- ① What claim and rhetorical question does the writer use in paragraph 1? Explain how they are intended to engage council members.

- ② Evaluate the use of CDC guidance in paragraph 2. What does it support, and which local claim would it not justify?

- ③ How does the writer respond to the cost and sidewalk concerns? Why might that response suit this audience better than dismissing the concerns?

- ④ Evaluate the final appeal to a rider carrying groceries. How does it work with the proposed report and possible pilot?

Write a 90-110-word email to a principal supporting investigation of a water refill station near the gym. Use this fictional evidence: student council counted 43 plastic bottles in nearby trash bins after one home game. Include a claim, reasoning limited to that tally, a counterclaim and response, a rhetorical question, and a clear action request. Do not invent cost savings or claim the tally proves a station will reduce waste.

Use the space for your complete 90-110-word email. Check that the evidence remains one game and the proposed benefits remain possibilities.

[illegible]

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Read this fictional city council speech. Underline the claim and request, circle the attributed evidence, and label a counterclaim and response. Evaluate how the writer balances persuasive language with the limits of the evidence. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What claim and rhetorical question does the writer use in paragraph 1? Explain how they are intended to engage council members.	The claim is that the council should investigate shelters for ten busy stops. The question about a seat but no shade highlights a gap in a public service and appeals to the council's responsibility for riders.
2	Evaluate the use of CDC guidance in paragraph 2. What does it support, and which local claim would it not justify?	The attributed advice supports shade as one precaution during heat risk. It does not prove a local design fits, establish local costs, or guarantee safety. Acknowledging that limit makes the appeal more credible for decision makers.
3	How does the writer respond to the cost and sidewalk concerns? Why might that response suit this audience better than dismissing the concerns?	The writer requests site, access and cost checks before a design decision. That gives the council a way to examine its practical responsibilities instead of assuming the concerns are already solved.
4	Evaluate the final appeal to a rider carrying groceries. How does it work with the proposed report and possible pilot?	It makes the issue concrete and appeals to concern for riders, while the report and conditional pilot supply an actionable process. It may make a cautious next step feel worthwhile; the example alone is not evidence of effectiveness.

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Principal Chen, please investigate a water refill station near the gym. In our fictional school, student council counted 43 plastic bottles in nearby trash bins after one home game. Could easier refilling encourage some visitors to choose reusable bottles? The tally suggests a possible opportunity, but it does not prove a station would reduce waste. Some people worry about installation costs. A facilities estimate would let us evaluate that concern before committing funds. Please ask the facilities team to check the location and price options, then share its findings with student council next month.

Accept supported judgments about the intended effects and limits of rhetorical choices. The transfer needs all requested techniques within 90-110 words. The one-game tally supplies a reason to investigate, not a forecast of savings or guaranteed behavior change. Passage source, paraphrased: CDC, "About Heat and Your Health," July 20, 2026, <https://www.cdc.gov/heat-health/about/index.html>. Riverton and the school tally are fictional.