

Draft Detectives

Use self-review and a partner's feedback to improve a draft.

9.W.3.B "Use peer- and self-evaluation to edit writing for clarity and quality of information, addressing strengths and making suggestions regarding how writing might be improved."

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB This is an invented school case. Read the actual draft and the planning notes. Underline a useful detail in the draft and circle a claim needing better support.

A Shelter at the Bus Loop

Draft to evaluate

Our school should add a covered waiting area beside the bus loop. During one rainy dismissal, 24 students waited along the sidewalk for buses. Everyone wants a shelter, and it will cost almost nothing. The shelter would be useful. This project is important, so we should do it.

Planning notes: invented data

- The count of 24 students came from one rainy dismissal; no survey has been conducted.
- No design, price or funding source has been selected.
- The transportation office must check that a possible location keeps bus doors and sidewalks clear.

Give useful feedback

Name a strength and explain its value. Then identify a specific problem and suggest a change. Check whether information is accurate, clear and useful to a decision maker. A suggestion such as add detail is too vague; name the needed detail. Never create a price or survey result to fill an evidence gap.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

- 1 Identify one strength of the draft and explain its value to a decision maker.

- 2** Identify one unsupported claim and write a specific review suggestion.

- 3** Rewrite the draft's ending so it names a useful next step rather than repeats importance.

3 YOUR TURN _____ Your own words

Write your own improved paragraph for this shelter proposal using only the supplied case. Complete self- and peer review, then edit a selected part of your writing.

1. Your working paragraph

State a recommendation, use an accurate case detail, explain its value and acknowledge missing information. Propose a next step.

2. Self-evaluation

Identify one strength with its value and one specific improvement for clarity or information quality.

3. Peer evaluation

Exchange sheets. Reviewer: write your name, explain one strength and suggest one specific improvement to this paragraph. Return it.

4. Apply feedback

Rewrite two or three sentences using a review suggestion. Add one sentence explaining how the change improves clarity or information quality.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

This is an invented school case. Read the actual draft and the planning notes. Underline a useful detail in the draft and circle a claim needing better support. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	Identify one strength of the draft and explain its value to a decision maker.	It names a location and gives a specific count from one rainy dismissal. The count offers a starting observation, though it does not show usual conditions.
2	Identify one unsupported claim and write a specific review suggestion.	Everyone wants a shelter lacks survey evidence. Suggest replacing it with a plan to survey students; alternatively, replace almost nothing with a plan to obtain a cost estimate.
3	Rewrite the draft's ending so it names a useful next step rather than repeats importance.	Before deciding, the school should ask the transportation office to check a possible location and request design and cost estimates.

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Working paragraph

The school should investigate a shelter beside the bus loop. During one rainy dismissal, 24 students waited along the sidewalk. This count suggests a reason to examine waiting conditions, although it may not represent a typical day. A shelter could offer cover from rain, but we need more information before choosing one. School leaders should gather additional counts, check a location and obtain estimates.

Self-evaluation

Strength: I limit the meaning of the single count. Improvement: I should identify who can check the location.

Peer evaluation: Sam

Strength: You request estimates instead of inventing a price. Improvement: Explain what a location check needs to establish.

Edited sentences

Before choosing a design, school leaders should ask the transportation office to check that a shelter would keep bus doors and sidewalks clear. Leaders should also request design and cost estimates.

Why this helps

The changes name the responsible office and the specific access concern, making the next step clearer.

TEACHER ASSESSMENT NOTES

Accept different supported paragraphs and specific feedback. Require both self-evaluation and a named peer evaluation of the student's own writing, with strengths and actionable suggestions, followed by an actual edit and explanation. Do not accept claims of universal support or a known low cost. A partner supplies feedback during the activity; the model reviewer is imagined. All four stages have separate writing space, and no word quota applies.