

Evidence Before Action

Use source evidence and its limits to make a provisional recommendation.

12.P.EICC.2.b “Make use of texts to build knowledge, develop skills, make informed decisions, and share information and ideas. (I/C)”

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Read all three supplied texts. Underline useful evidence and label it H for health guidance, L for local experience, or O for an operational constraint. Mark one remaining information need N. Riverton, the local memo and the survey below are fictional practice material.

Three Sources for a School-Start Decision

- ① Text A: Public-health source summary. CDC’s Sleep and Health page reports that the American Academy of Sleep Medicine recommends eight to ten hours of sleep per twenty-four hours for ages thirteen to eighteen. It also reports the American Academy of Pediatrics recommendation that middle and high schools start no earlier than 8:30 a.m. This is a general health benchmark. It does not choose a bus plan for Riverton or establish how much any particular Riverton student sleeps.
- ② Text B: Fictional district transportation memo. “Our high school and middle schools share buses on successive routes. A later high-school run could change a middle-school run. We have not yet compared alternative schedules or their costs. Before recommending a new bell, staff should prepare route options, check travel and arrival times, and identify effects on other schools. A shared fleet is a planning constraint; it does not by itself prove that a later start is impossible.”
- ③ Text C: Fictional student survey report. “Of the Riverton students who chose to respond, 62 percent reported usually sleeping fewer than eight hours on school nights. Participation was voluntary. These are self-reports, not direct sleep measurements, and they do not represent every student automatically. The responses suggest an issue worth examining alongside other evidence. Families have not yet been asked about proposed route or schedule changes; their feedback remains an information need.”

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 How does Text A serve a different purpose from Text C?

2 What constraint does B identify, and what investigation would help the board address it?

3 Why would it be inaccurate to say that 62 percent of all Riverton students were measured sleeping too little?

4 Explain how the board can use these texts without claiming that they already establish the best schedule.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write a 90–120-word recommendation note to the school board using the supplied texts. Take a provisional position on a later start, use at least two sources by letter, address the shared-bus constraint, and identify one specific information need. Distinguish a recommendation from a conclusion already proved.

Make an evidence-based recommendation

Use accurate source details and explain how they inform the decision. Keep general guidance, local self-reports and operational information distinct. The note should give board members useful reasoning and a next information need.

This image shows a blank sheet of white paper with horizontal ruling lines. The lines are evenly spaced and run across the width of the page. There are no margins, text, or other markings on the paper.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Read all three supplied texts. Underline useful evidence and label it H for health guidance, L for local experience, or O for an operational constraint. Mark one remaining information need N. Riverton, the local memo and the survey below are fictional practice material. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How does Text A serve a different purpose from Text C?	A supplies a general health benchmark; C reports local respondents' experiences. Neither establishes every local student's actual sleep.
2	What constraint does B identify, and what investigation would help the board address it?	Successive high- and middle-school routes share buses. Comparing schedule options, travel/arrival times, costs and effects on other schools would help.
3	Why would it be inaccurate to say that 62 percent of all Riverton students were measured sleeping too little?	Only voluntary respondents supplied self-reports. The report neither measures sleep directly nor represents all students automatically.
4	Explain how the board can use these texts without claiming that they already establish the best schedule.	A and C justify considering sleep needs; B identifies a constraint and research to do. Route comparisons and family feedback remain missing, so any recommendation is provisional.

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

The board should study a later high school start before choosing a schedule. Text A supplies a health benchmark of 8:30 a.m. or later, while Text C reports that many voluntary respondents describe short sleep. Neither source proves that a particular local schedule will work. Text B explains that high school and middle school routes share buses, so changes may affect both groups. Staff should compare route options, travel times and costs, then seek family feedback. This approach takes the sleep evidence seriously while recognizing the survey's limits and the need for a workable transportation plan.

Accept varied provisional positions supported by at least two supplied sources, an accurate shared-bus constraint and a concrete remaining information need. The model is within 90–120 words. The 62 percent is about voluntary respondents, not all students or measured sleep. All local records are explicitly fictional. Text A paraphrases CDC, Sleep and Health, cdc.gov/physical-activity-education/staying-healthy/sleep.html (checked September 11, 2026). No outside reading is required; the complete classroom sources are supplied. Assess informed reasoning and the sharing of accurate ideas, not agreement with a required policy position.