

Two Views of Eagle

Compare a participant's words with a historical overview.

ELA.4.R.3.3 "Compare and contrast accounts of the same event using primary and/or secondary sources."

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB In Source A, underline Armstrong's landing report and circle Duke's words showing relief. In Source B, underline the landing location and circle the sentence about the mission's earlier goal.

The Eagle Lands - Two Sources

- ① **Read the sources.** On July 20, 1969, Neil Armstrong and Buzz Aldrin landed the Apollo 11 lunar module Eagle on the Moon. Michael Collins remained in the command module in lunar orbit. Source A preserves words spoken by people taking part in the landing. Source B is a historical overview explaining the event. Compare the information and the source roles. A participant's memory written later can still be firsthand; the date alone does not decide the source type.
- ② **Source A - words from the landing radio transcript.** Armstrong reported from Eagle: "Houston, Tranquility Base here. The Eagle has landed." Charles Duke, speaking from Mission Control on Earth, replied during his next message: "We're breathing again. Thanks a lot." These are selected excerpts, not the entire conversation. Source: NASA, *Apollo Lunar Surface Journal: The First Lunar Landing*, transmissions at 102:45:58 and 102:46:06 after launch; nasa.gov/wp-content/uploads/static/history/alsj/a11/a11.landing.html.
- ③ **Source B - summary of a historical overview.** Eagle landed in the Sea of Tranquility, partly piloted by Armstrong. The landing was about four miles beyond the predicted touchdown point. It was part of the mission's goal of landing people on the Moon and bringing them safely home, a goal President Kennedy had announced in 1961. The overview brings these facts together to explain the mission, instead of presenting only the radio exchange. Adapted from Sarah A. Loff, NASA, *Apollo 11 Mission Overview*, April 17, 2015; nasa.gov/history/apollo-11-mission-overview/.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 What landing information do both sources provide? Give one detail from each.

2 What does A reveal about the people's response that B's summary does not?

3 Give two details in B that are absent from A's printed excerpts.

4 How do the different source roles help explain these differences? Do more facts automatically make B a better source for every question?

3

YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write a four-sentence comparison of the two printed sources. State a similarity, describe one important difference using details from both, explain how source roles help account for that difference, and name which source better answers a question about the controllers' reaction.

Compare with evidence

Use A and B by name. Keep the comparison tied to the printed material. Explain your source choice rather than choosing only because an account is older or longer.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

In Source A, underline Armstrong's landing report and circle Duke's words showing relief. In Source B, underline the landing location and circle the sentence about the mission's earlier goal. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What landing information do both sources provide? Give one detail from each.	A records Armstrong reporting that Eagle has landed at Tranquility Base. B says Eagle landed in the Sea of Tranquility. Both establish the successful Moon landing.
2	What does A reveal about the people's response that B's summary does not?	Duke's remark about breathing again conveys relief after the landing. B reports mission facts without those immediate words of relief.
3	Give two details in B that are absent from A's printed excerpts.	Accept any two: Armstrong partly piloted Eagle; landing was about four miles beyond the predicted point; the mission goal included a safe return; Kennedy announced the goal in 1961.
4	How do the different source roles help explain these differences? Do more facts automatically make B a better source for every question?	A preserves participants' immediate words, so it helps reveal the report and reaction. B combines facts into a historical explanation, adding context. Neither is better for every question; usefulness depends on what the reader needs.

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Both A and B describe Eagle's successful Moon landing. A includes Duke's relieved response, while B explains the earlier mission goal and where Eagle landed compared with the plan. A preserves words of participants at the event, but B combines mission facts for a historical explanation. A better answers a question about the controllers' reaction because Duke's words reveal relief.

The radio excerpts are primary material from people participating in the landing; the NASA overview is used here as a secondary explanation of the event. Judge source type by relationship to the event, not simply publication date. The journal also contains later commentary; the selected A quotations are specifically the mission transmissions. Accept accurate comparisons supported by the printed excerpts and summary. Do not treat B's extra context as proof that it is always more useful.