

Make the Case

Study how a proposal uses reasons, evidence, and transitions.

ELA.5.C.1 "Communicating Through Writing"

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline the opening claim sentence. Label the first reason First and the second reason Second. Circle First, In addition, and For these reasons where they connect the argument.

A Refill Station for Cedar School - A Fictional Proposal

- ① Cedar School should install a water bottle refill station near the gym. First, students need convenient access to drinking water. The Centers for Disease Control and Prevention explains that access to water helps students stay hydrated and offers a healthy alternative to sugary drinks. A refill station could support that access after activity. This is a proposed benefit, not a measured result at Cedar School. Source summary: CDC, *Water Access in Schools*; cdc.gov/school-nutrition/water-access/index.html.
- ② In addition, refilling bottles could reduce throw-away packaging. The Environmental Protection Agency recommends carrying a reusable water bottle to cut waste. A student who refills a bottle can use it again instead of discarding a single-use bottle. That connection supports the proposal, although the amount of waste avoided would depend on how students use the station. Source summary: EPA, *Ten Ways to Unpackage Your Life*; epa.gov/trash-free-waters/ten-ways-unpackage-your-life.
- ③ Some people may worry about the cost. The school could ask its parent group to help plan funding, but donations should not be treated as guaranteed. Before installation, staff would need to check costs, cleaning, water quality, and access for all students. For these reasons, Cedar School should investigate a refill station near the gym. The proposal aims to make drinking water convenient while helping students use bottles again; the school would still need a workable plan.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 What is the opening claim, and what does the final paragraph ask the school to do next?

2 Explain how the CDC evidence supports the first reason without proving a result at Cedar School.

3 How do the EPA evidence and the bottle example support the second reason?

4 How do the transitions help organize the proposal? Explain the jobs of First, In addition, and For these reasons.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write your own three-paragraph proposal of 90-120 words for making bottle refilling easier at the fictional Cedar School. Choose a location or refill routine. Use both printed sources, two reasons with explanations, and at least three transitions. End by restating your claim.

Paragraph 1: claim

Introduce your location or routine and state your claim. Keep proposed changes separate from facts in the sources.

Paragraph 2: reasons and evidence

Give two logical reasons. Name CDC and EPA when using their facts, and explain how each fact supports your idea. Use transitions to connect the reasons.

Paragraph 3: conclusion and review

Restate your claim. You may add a reasonable next planning step. Read all three paragraphs and check evidence, transitions, spelling, and punctuation.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Underline the opening claim sentence. Label the first reason First and the second reason Second. Circle First, In addition, and For these reasons where they connect the argument. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What is the opening claim, and what does the final paragraph ask the school to do next?	The opening proposes a refill station near the gym. The ending asks the school to investigate it and plan costs, cleaning, water quality, and access before installation.
2	Explain how the CDC evidence supports the first reason without proving a result at Cedar School.	CDC connects water access with hydration and a healthy drink choice. This supports considering easier access, but does not measure Cedar students' behavior or show a station's local effect.
3	How do the EPA evidence and the bottle example support the second reason?	EPA recommends a reusable bottle to cut waste. The example explains the mechanism: refilling lets a student use a bottle again instead of discarding one.
4	How do the transitions help organize the proposal? Explain the jobs of First, In addition, and For these reasons.	First introduces the water-access reason; In addition adds a waste-reduction reason; For these reasons connects the conclusion to both reasons.

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Cedar School should add a bottle-refill station near the playground. A convenient location would give students a place to refill their bottles after outdoor play.

First, CDC explains that water access helps students stay hydrated. A nearby station would create an opportunity to drink water. In addition, EPA recommends reusable bottles to cut waste. Refilling the same bottle could replace a throw-away bottle instead of adding another item to the bin.

Therefore, Cedar should investigate a refill station near the playground. Staff could check costs, water quality, and access before deciding whether to install it.

The Cedar School scenario and proposals are fictional; source claims are attributed factual summaries. The model has three separate paragraphs and meets the 90-120 word range. Accept reasonable locations or routines supported by both sources, two reasons with elaboration, varied transitions, and a restated claim. Students should distinguish proposed outcomes from measured local results. No new outside source search is required.