

Monarchs in Three Voices

Compare how three genres present one science topic.

ELA.5.R.3 "Reading Across Genres"

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Complete two separate marking tasks. First, underline one detail about butterfly movement in each of the three texts. Then circle these additional targets: in Text 1, the phrases river of wings and clouds drift like gray blankets; in Text 2, the date and the count of butterflies. Circles identify language and observation details; underlines identify movement.

A Monarch Journey

- ① Text 1: A classroom prose poem. A monarch's orange wings lift at dawn. "South," whispers the cool September air. It floats past a gold field, following sunlight over miles. By evening, it rests among trees, one small traveler in a wide, moving river of wings. Clouds drift like gray blankets above, but the butterfly keeps its bright path toward warmer places.
- ② Text 2: A fictional field journal. September 18. At the lakeshore, I watched monarchs gather on asters before noon. Their wings opened and closed in the sun. Later, the butterflies lifted together and headed southwest. I counted thirty in five minutes, but more passed beyond the trees. I wrote down the wind direction because it seemed to help their flight.
- ③ Text 3: Science explanation. Each fall, eastern North American migratory monarchs travel to central Mexico. Most spend winter in mountain forests there. In spring, surviving adults begin traveling north; later generations continue through the breeding grounds before a new generation migrates south in fall. Adult monarchs feed on flower nectar, while caterpillars eat milkweed. Educational summary of the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service Monarch species profile, Habitat and Behavior sections: [fws.gov/species/monarch-danaus-plexippus](https://www.fws.gov/species/monarch-danaus-plexippus).

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE _____ Use the passage

1 What shared movement idea appears in the three texts? Give one detail from each.

2 What does river of wings suggest in the poem, and how is that way of explaining movement different from Text 3?

3 What kind of detail does the fictional field journal add that the general explanation does not?

4 Which text best answers where eastern migratory monarchs spend winter? Why?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write a four-sentence announcement welcoming visitors to a classroom monarch display. Use facts from Text 3 and avoid inventing local sightings. Then write two sentences comparing your announcement with Text 1 and Text 2, explaining a difference from each.

Write the announcement

Use a clear welcome and factual explanation for visitors. You may invite readers to compare the printed texts; do not present the fictional journal as scientific evidence.

Compare the genres

In one sentence compare your announcement with the poem. In another compare it with the fictional journal. Explain a difference in language or the kind of details used.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Complete two separate marking tasks. First, underline one detail about butterfly movement in each of the three texts. Then circle these additional targets: in Text 1, the phrases river of wings and clouds drift like gray blankets; in Text 2, the date and the count of butterflies. Circles identify language and observation details; underlines identify movement. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What shared movement idea appears in the three texts? Give one detail from each.	They describe southward monarch travel in fall: the poem names south and September; the fictional journal reports southwest movement in September; the explanation describes fall travel to central Mexico.
2	What does river of wings suggest in the poem, and how is that way of explaining movement different from Text 3?	It compares many moving butterflies with a flowing river, suggesting a large, continuous stream of movement. Text 3 explains the migration cycle with general facts rather than this image.
3	What kind of detail does the fictional field journal add that the general explanation does not?	It models one observer recording a date, place, direction, and a count of thirty butterflies in five minutes. It is an invented classroom observation, not a real data source.
4	Which text best answers where eastern migratory monarchs spend winter? Why?	Text 3 directly identifies mountain forests in central Mexico. The other texts emphasize an imagined moment of travel instead.

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Welcome to our monarch migration display. Each fall, eastern North American migratory monarchs travel to central Mexico. Survivors start north in spring, and later generations continue the journey. Read the three texts to compare a poet's images, one imagined observation, and a scientific explanation.

Unlike Text 1, the announcement states the migration cycle plainly instead of comparing butterflies to a river. Unlike Text 2, it addresses visitors and gives general facts rather than recording one observer's dated sighting.

Text 1 is a prose poem, so a paragraph is an intentional literary form. Text 2 models a field journal but its observation is fictional. Text 3 is an attributed scientific summary. Accept accurate comparisons and analysis of the river metaphor or blanket simile. The four-sentence announcement can include an invitation to read the display; it should not assert unsupported sightings in a particular park. The final two comparison sentences should distinguish the announcement from both literary texts.