

A Policy Worth Testing

Connect evidence and classmates' ideas before deciding.

CCSS.ELA-Literacy.SL.8.1 "Engage effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (one-on-one, in groups, and teacher-led) with diverse partners on grade 8 topics, texts, and issues, building on others' ideas and expressing their own clearly."

NAME _____

DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK _____ Read it twice

YOUR JOB Read before the discussions. Underline two useful details and circle one limit on what the evidence can show.

A proposal and perspectives for discussion

- ① Fictional school proposal: Grade 8 will test a phone policy for two weeks. The class has 28 students. Approved accessibility arrangements continue under either option, and the office will relay urgent family messages. Option A keeps personal phones in bags during lessons and uses school tablets for planned digital tasks. Option B lets teachers invite personal-phone use for a specific task, with phones returned to bags afterward. Students without phones may use school tablets. Both options are feasible with the available supervision.
- ② There are 16 school tablets, so all 28 students can work in pairs without personal phones. Six lessons in the trial will involve a photograph or web task. A teacher recorded 10 unrelated phone alerts during four lessons last week; this does not establish how either proposed policy would change learning. In a volunteer survey of 20 students, 12 chose A, 6 chose B, and 2 were undecided. These are separate groups, and the survey may not represent the whole grade.
- ③ Student comments offer other perspectives. Hana wants a predictable rule so students know when to put devices away. Luis says his personal phone is familiar and quick to use for a task. Imani wants everyone to have an equally useful way to participate. Your recommendation may choose A, B, or a modification consistent with the stated resources and accessibility arrangements. Identify what the trial should measure before the school makes a lasting decision.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE Use the passage

- 1 Before talking, write your recommendation, two supporting details with paragraph numbers, and a question to investigate.

- 2 Talk with a partner for five minutes. Each person explains a view with evidence, asks for explanation, replies, and builds on a peer's idea. Record that idea, your response, and both a question and its reply.

- 3 Form a new group of 3-4. Assign facilitator, timer, recorder, and evidence checker; in threes combine facilitator/timer. Take turns; aim for a recommendation within ten minutes. Each person connects two peers' ideas in a question, answers with evidence, and helps qualify the group's view. Record your question, a reply, and the group's conclusion or disagreement.

- 4 Join a twelve-minute teacher-led circle of 6-8 from different groups. Each learner compares recommendations, cites evidence, and responds to a peer. Record two new ideas and how they change, qualify, or support your view.

3 YOUR TURN Your own words

After all three live discussions, write an individual reflection: your first view, a specific new idea from a classmate, and your current recommendation with evidence. Explain why you changed, qualified, or kept your view.

Your evidence-based reflection

Use what classmates actually said. Include one question that helped you understand or connect ideas, and its effect on the discussion.

PART 1 • READ AND MARK

Read before the discussions. Underline two useful details and circle one limit on what the evidence can show. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 • ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	Before talking, write your recommendation, two supporting details with paragraph numbers, and a question to investigate.	A may be supported by tablet access for planned tasks (paragraph 1) and enough tablets for all 28 students in pairs (paragraph 2). Ask which trial observations would test its benefits. The alert count does not establish which policy is better. Require a position, two accurate details with locators, and a question.
2	Talk with a partner for five minutes. Each person explains a view with evidence, asks for explanation, replies, and builds on a peer's idea. Record that idea, your response, and both a question and its reply.	Observe both learners explaining, questioning, replying, and building on a peer's idea. Records should identify the actual idea, connected contribution, question/reply, and accurate source evidence. Prepared statements alone are insufficient.
3	Form a new group of 3-4. Assign facilitator, timer, recorder, and evidence checker; in threes combine facilitator/timer. Take turns; aim for a recommendation within ten minutes. Each person connects two peers' ideas in a question, answers with evidence, and helps qualify the group's view. Record your question, a reply, and the group's conclusion or disagreement.	Assess each learner's required moves, regardless of role. Check the question, relevant reply, evidence, and work toward the deadline. Accept a supported recommendation or clearly stated disagreement.
4	Join a twelve-minute teacher-led circle of 6-8 from different groups. Each learner compares recommendations, cites evidence, and responds to a peer. Record two new ideas and how they change, qualify, or support your view.	Verify each learner participates in the circle. Records acknowledge new peer information and explain a change, qualification, or evidence-based reason to keep a view. Changing a well-supported position is unnecessary.

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

At first, I favored B because familiar devices might save time. A classmate pointed out that 16 tablets can serve 28 students in pairs, while another emphasized the need for a predictable rule. I asked how we could keep that clarity while using familiar devices. I now support a limited B trial with explicit start-and-stop cues, equal tablet access, and records of off-task alerts and participation. The trial would test that choice; the volunteer survey alone cannot prove it is best.

Plan two lessons if needed so every student completes the teacher-led circle. Observe actual participation in each format; written records alone are not proof. Rotate partners/groups, use respectful turn-taking, and assess every learner regardless of role. The sample is a fictional reflection illustrating reasoning, not a record of a real student. Accept feasible alternatives supported by the sources.