Smoke Plan Showdown

Compare a health brief with a facilities memo.

11.RI.3 "Integration of Concepts Analyze information within and between paired passages for similar and conflicting ideas and how authors reach similar or different conclusions. Compare and contrast informational and technical texts for intent..."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline each author's main conclusion, circle evidence or technical details that support it, and number one point where the texts agree and one point where they differ.

Two Plans for Smoke Days

1. These two texts are invented classroom memos, not statements from a real county or engineer. Text A : School health memo: Smoke can contain fine particles that worsen breathing problems. Staff should consult current local AQI and school activity guidance before outdoor practices. At Unhealthy levels, the guidance calls for more breaks, less intensity, and considering moving long or intense activity indoors or rescheduling. At Very Unhealthy levels, it calls for all activity indoors or rescheduling. This author favors moving a planned long practice to a suitable indoor space because students can keep their routine.

2. Text A explains the AQI categories in plain language for families. It says staff should follow individual asthma plans and current local guidance, not wait for symptoms before taking precautions. Its recommendation assumes the indoor space has appropriate air quality and capacity. It says little about how a building team would establish those conditions.

3. Text B : Facilities memo: This author shares the health goal and accepts the activity guidance, but favors rescheduling the long practice if suitable indoor space cannot be confirmed. Before smoke season, the team should assess ventilation and filtration; EPA recommends considering MERV 13 or the highest filter rating a system can accommodate, with appropriate professional advice. A filter rating alone does not certify a room's air quality. The author includes equipment and space constraints for technicians. Text B's conditional recommendation is more operationally detailed but harder for families to interpret.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What concern do both texts share? Identify one different type of support each text uses for that concern.

2. How do the authors' preferred responses differ for the planned long practice? What condition matters?

3. Compare the authors' purposes. How does each author's purpose shape the information included?

4. Which text is clearer for a family deciding whether an outdoor practice should change? Use two features of the texts to explain your answer.

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Write exactly three sentences recommending a smoke-day plan for a school. Include one point where the texts agree, one difference between their conclusions, and a final decision that explains which text you would follow more closely for outdoor activities.

ANSWER KEY

Smoke Plan Showdown

GRADE 11 · 11.RI.3

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline each author's main conclusion, circle evidence or technical details that support it, and number one point where the texts agree and one point where they differ. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What concern do both texts share? Identify one different type of support each text uses for that concern.	**Both seek to reduce smoke exposure. Text A uses AQI categories and activity guidance; Text B uses building, filtration and capacity constraints.**
2	How do the authors' preferred responses differ for the planned long practice? What condition matters?	**A prefers a suitable indoor location to preserve the routine. B favors rescheduling if indoor suitability cannot be confirmed. Both follow activity guidance; B questions whether the indoor option is feasible.**
3	Compare the authors' purposes. How does each author's purpose shape the information included?	**A explains activity decisions to families, using plain-language categories. B guides building operations, using filtration and space constraints.**
4	Which text is clearer for a family deciding whether an outdoor practice should change? Use two features of the texts to explain your answer.	**A can be clearer for families because it explains the categories in plain language and states a preferred activity plan. B includes technical filter terminology and a conditional building assessment. Accept another supported judgment.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Both authors support reducing smoke exposure and following school activity guidance. A prefers a suitable indoor location, whereas B favors rescheduling if that location cannot be confirmed. I would use B's conditional plan because preserving a routine depends on having an appropriate indoor space.

Accept equivalent descriptions of the shared goal, differing conclusions, and audience-based clarity. For the open response, require exactly three sentences that accurately integrate an agreement, a difference, and a supported recommendation. Fictional reading exercise, not a complete school emergency plan. Background: AirNow/EPA, "Air Quality and Outdoor Activity Guidance for Schools," airnow.gov/publications/activity-guides/air-quality-and-outdoor-activity-guidance-for-schools/; EPA, "Wildfires and Indoor Air Quality in Schools and Commercial Buildings," epa.gov/emergencies-iaq/wildfires-and-indoor-air-quality-schools-and-commercial-buildings.