Same Facts, New Lens

Compare evidence and interpretations in two science articles.

7.T.T.2.b "Analyze how two or more authors writing about the same topic shape their presentations of key information by emphasizing different evidence or advancing different interpretations of facts. (I)"

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Read both classroom model articles. Underline evidence Ortiz uses in Article A and circle evidence Bell uses in Article B. Label one detail O or B to show each writer's interpretation. Compare the writers' actual words, not only a narrator's description of their views.

One Park, Two Views: Two Classroom Model Articles

1. **Article A: Lena Ortiz, fictional classroom writer.** In 1995 and 1996, wildlife managers released 31 wolves captured in Canada into Yellowstone National Park. I see this return as a major step in restoring a complete food web. Wolves hunt elk, especially animals that are old, sick, or separated from a herd. The growth of wolf packs shows that the park again supports a missing native predator. These details lead me to emphasize ecological restoration.

2. **Article B: Marcus Bell, fictional classroom writer.** I see wolf recovery as a success that also requires careful management. Ranchers sometimes worry about wolves attacking livestock; confirmed wolf-caused losses near Yellowstone are tracked, and compensation programs may pay for verified losses. Hunters have noticed that elk numbers declined after the 1990s. I would not credit wolves alone: hunting outside the park, drought, and habitat changes are other possible causes. These details lead me to consider effects on people as well as ecological change.

3. These are two separately voiced classroom model articles, not quotations from published authors. Both discuss the same restoration effort but select evidence for different interpretations. Yellowstone's wolf return did not cause one simple result: biologists also study weather, hunting beyond park borders, disease, and habitat when explaining elk changes. Ranchers may use fencing or range riders to reduce conflicts. The articles let you compare an ecological-restoration emphasis with a management-and-human-effects emphasis.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What interpretation of wolf reintroduction does Ortiz advance? Name one detail she uses to support it.

2. What interpretation does Bell advance? Name one type of evidence he includes that Ortiz does not emphasize.

3. Bell lists hunting, drought, and habitat changes along with wolves. What does this list suggest about his view of the elk decline?

4. How do Ortiz's and Bell's choices of evidence guide readers toward different ideas about the same wolf restoration effort?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Use these facts about a school garden: it cost $1,200 to build, classes use it once a week, and it produced 400 pounds of vegetables in its first year. Write two two-sentence mini-articles, one that presents the garden as a strong investment and one that presents it as a cost that needs careful planning. Each mini-article must use at least one fact and show a different interpretation.

ANSWER KEY # Same Facts, New Lens

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Read both classroom model articles. Underline evidence Ortiz uses in Article A and circle evidence Bell uses in Article B. Label one detail O or B to show each writer's interpretation. Compare the writers' actual words, not only a narrator's description of their views. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What interpretation of wolf reintroduction does Ortiz advance? Name one detail she uses to support it.	**Ortiz presents wolf reintroduction as restoring the ecosystem. She uses wolves hunting elk or the growth of wolf packs as support.**
2	What interpretation does Bell advance? Name one type of evidence he includes that Ortiz does not emphasize.	**Bell presents wolf recovery as a success that needs careful management. He includes livestock concerns, compensation for verified losses, or other causes of elk decline.**
3	Bell lists hunting, drought, and habitat changes along with wolves. What does this list suggest about his view of the elk decline?	**It suggests that wolves may be one cause, but they are not the only cause of elk decline.**
4	How do Ortiz's and Bell's choices of evidence guide readers toward different ideas about the same wolf restoration effort?	**Ortiz's evidence about predators and pack growth guides readers to see ecological restoration. Bell's evidence about ranchers and several causes of change guides readers to consider management and effects on people.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Author A: The school garden is a strong investment because classes use it every week for hands-on learning. In its first year, it produced 400 pounds of vegetables, giving students a useful result from their work.

Author B: The garden's $1,200 building cost means the school should plan its budget carefully. Although it produced 400 pounds of vegetables in its first year, leaders must decide whether that benefit is worth the expense.

Accept equivalent descriptions of each writer's interpretation when students connect it to accurate passage evidence. For Part 3, accept varied wording if each mini-article uses a supplied fact and clearly advances a different view. The supplied articles are explicitly fictional classroom models, not authenticated published quotations. Compare their actual evidence and interpretation; accept supported alternatives.