Voices on Maple

Compare how sources shape a debate about a protected bike lane.

9.T.C.2.a "Compare and contrast varying perspectives on a particular topic found across a variety of texts, analyzing how texts establish and develop perspective to shape perceptions or beliefs. (I)"

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Read the narrator's overview and the three supplied fictional text excerpts. Underline each author's view and circle the evidence or language used in the actual excerpts to develop it. Maps, charts and photographs mentioned here are described attachments, not supplied images.

A Debate on Maple Avenue

(1) This Riverton case and all writers, documents and data below are classroom-authored fiction. At a public meeting in Riverton, the transportation department released a two-page brief about a proposed protected bike lane on Maple Avenue. The brief lists 42 reported crashes involving cyclists or pedestrians during the past five years and includes a map of the street's schools, library, and bus stops. It says the lane would replace one travel lane for six blocks, leaving two lanes for cars. A chart projects that the change could add about one minute to a typical car trip at afternoon rush hour. The brief also notes that federal safety grants could cover much of construction.

(2) During the same meeting, Malik Chen, who owns a bakery on Maple Avenue, submitted a letter to the council. He wrote that customers often carry cake boxes or pick up large orders, so they need places to stop near the storefront. Chen described seeing a delivery driver circle the block twice on a rainy Saturday before leaving without unloading flour. He asked the council to preserve curbside loading spaces and to test the lane for three months before making it permanent. His letter included signatures from 18 nearby business owners and a photograph of a crowded curb at noon.

③ A week later, ninth grader Sofia Alvarez published an opinion column in the school newspaper. She recalled biking home beside Maple Avenue when a van's open door forced her toward moving traffic. "I was shaking when I reached the next block," she wrote. Alvarez argued that students should be able to travel without choosing between riding on the sidewalk and riding beside cars. Rather than citing crash totals, she described the noise of buses, doors opening, and drivers turning across the bike route. She invited readers to attend the council vote and bring a helmet to place on the meeting-room steps.

THREE ACTUAL CONTRASTING CLASSROOM TEXT EXCERPTS

Writer and text	Read the author's words
Riverton Transportation Department, Maple Avenue brief (fictional)	We recommend testing a protected bike lane on Maple Avenue. The record lists 42 cyclist or pedestrian crashes in five years. Our described street map identifies schools, the library and bus stops; the proposed lane replaces one travel lane for six blocks and leaves two car lanes. Our traffic projection estimates about one extra minute at afternoon rush hour, and safety grants could cover much of construction. We present these figures to support a practical safety improvement. The projection is an estimate, not a guarantee.
Malik Chen, council letter (fictional)	Please protect curbside loading spaces and test the lane for three months before making it permanent. At my bakery, customers carry cake boxes and collect large orders. I saw a driver circle twice on a rainy Saturday and leave without unloading our flour. Eighteen neighboring business owners signed my letter. I described a noon photograph of a crowded curb to show why access matters. A safety plan must also let customers and deliveries reach the businesses.
Sofia Alvarez, school opinion column (fictional)	A van door forced me toward moving traffic while I biked home on Maple Avenue. I was shaking when I reached the next block. I remember buses roaring, doors opening and drivers turning across my route. Students should not have to choose between the sidewalk and riding beside cars. Those details make the danger personal for me. Attend the council vote and bring a helmet for the meeting-room steps: show that safe travel matters.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What concern about Maple Avenue connects the transportation brief and Alvarez's column? Give one detail from each source that develops that concern.

2. Compare how the transportation brief and Alvarez establish their perspectives. What type of evidence does each use, and how could each type affect readers?

3. What does Chen want the council to do? Explain how his delivery anecdote and included materials develop his perspective.

4. Chen and Alvarez both use an individual experience. How do their experiences lead readers to focus on different possible effects of the proposal?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

In 70 to 90 words, recommend a decision to the fictional Riverton council. Use details from at least two supplied text excerpts and explain how their authors build their perspectives. You may use the overview for context, but compare the authors' actual printed words; do not claim to have inspected a map, chart or photograph merely described in the texts.

ANSWER KEY # Voices on Maple

GRADE 9 · 9.T.C.2.a

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Read the narrator's overview and the three supplied fictional text excerpts. Underline each author's view and circle the evidence or language used in the actual excerpts to develop it. Maps, charts and photographs mentioned here are described attachments, not supplied images. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What concern about Maple Avenue connects the transportation brief and Alvarez's column? Give one detail from each source that develops that concern.	**Both sources focus on safety for people traveling on Maple Avenue. The brief lists 42 crashes involving cyclists or pedestrians, while Alvarez describes being forced toward moving traffic by an open van door.**
2	Compare how the transportation brief and Alvarez establish their perspectives. What type of evidence does each use, and how could each type affect readers?	**The brief uses statistics, a map, and a traffic-time projection, which can make its perspective seem measured and practical. Alvarez uses a personal experience and sensory details, which can make the danger feel immediate and personal.**
3	What does Chen want the council to do? Explain how his delivery anecdote and included materials develop his perspective.	**Chen wants the council to preserve loading spaces and test the lane for three months. His story about the driver leaving without unloading flour, along with business-owner signatures and a curb photograph, emphasizes possible problems for businesses and deliveries.**
4	Chen and Alvarez both use an individual experience. How do their experiences lead readers to focus on different possible effects of the proposal?	**Chen's experience directs attention to customer access and delivery needs for businesses. Alvarez's experience directs attention to the physical risk that cyclists face near traffic.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

Riverton should approve a three-month bike-lane test while protecting marked loading spaces. The transportation brief supports action with crash data, a map, and a prediction of only one extra minute for drivers. Alvarez makes the safety concern personal through her account of being forced toward traffic. Chen's delivery story and curb photograph show that the plan must address business access. Using both safety evidence and a trial period responds to the strongest concerns in all three texts.

Accept equivalent explanations of each source's perspective when students support them with accurate passage details. For the open response, accept different recommendations if the response uses at least two sources and explains how their evidence, language, or examples shape readers' views. Compare the directly supplied classroom-authored excerpts, retaining all four valid source keys. Statistics/projections versus personal sensory language are present in their actual words. Map/chart/photo attachments are described, not displayed; accept analysis of their stated roles without pretending visual inspection. The model's described-map/photo references are source statements. Check the70-to-90-word recommendation for at least two actual excerpts and explained perspective-building choices. Other supported positions are welcome.