Change Your Claim

Track how evidence reshapes a recommendation.

8.6.I "reflect on and adjust responses as new evidence is presented; and"

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Underline Lila's first recommendation, circle each new piece of evidence, and label her two revised recommendations 1 and 2 so you can trace how her thinking changes.

A Garden Plan Reconsidered

1. When Riverside Middle proposed replacing part of its lawn with a native-plant garden, student reporter Lila wrote that the project would probably save water and attract pollinators. Her first source was the city parks website, which explained that native plants usually need less irrigation after they are established. Based on that source, Lila recommended approving the garden. Although her source said after establishment, Lila mistakenly assumed roots would grow deep by the first summer and weekly watering could be reduced right away.

2. Then Lila interviewed the school grounds manager, who said the garden would need regular watering for its first two summers. He also estimated that removing turf, buying plants, and installing mulch would cost about $4,000. This evidence did not prove that the garden was a poor idea, but it challenged Lila's prediction of immediate savings. She revised her response: the school should approve the garden only if it budgets for installation and early care. She no longer claimed that summer watering could be reduced right away.

3. At a school board meeting, a local ecologist added another source of evidence. She explained that native plants can provide food and shelter for insects and birds, but she warned that some species grow poorly in compacted soil. A soil test showed that the proposed site had compacted ground. Lila adjusted her response again. She still supported the garden, yet she recommended testing and loosening the soil before planting, choosing species suited to the site, and reviewing water use after two summers.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. What was Lila's first recommendation, and what source supported it?

2. What new evidence caused Lila to reject her prediction of immediate water savings?

3. How did Lila adjust her recommendation after learning about the garden's early costs and care needs?

4. How did the soil test change Lila's final recommendation?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Imagine your student council is deciding whether to add a shaded outdoor study area. Initial evidence shows that many students want more shade, but maintenance staff reports that trees take years to provide shade and a fabric canopy needs yearly repairs. Write three sentences that state an initial response, adjust it using the new evidence, and give a final conditional recommendation. Use extra paper if needed.

ANSWER KEY

Change Your Claim

GRADE 8 · TEKS 8.6.I

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Underline Lila's first recommendation, circle each new piece of evidence, and label her two revised recommendations 1 and 2 so you can trace how her thinking changes. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	What was Lila's first recommendation, and what source supported it?	**She recommended approving the garden. The city parks website supported her idea by explaining that native plants usually need less irrigation after they are established.**
2	What new evidence caused Lila to reject her prediction of immediate water savings?	**The grounds manager said the garden would need regular watering for its first two summers.**
3	How did Lila adjust her recommendation after learning about the garden's early costs and care needs?	**She said the school should approve the garden only if it budgets for installation and early care.**
4	How did the soil test change Lila's final recommendation?	**She still supported the garden, but she recommended testing and loosening the soil, choosing suitable species, and reviewing water use after two summers.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

At first, I would support planting trees because the survey shows students want more shade. After learning that trees will not provide shade quickly and that a canopy needs repairs each year, I would adjust my response. I would recommend a canopy only if the school can pay for yearly repairs while young trees grow.

Accept responses that identify a change in Lila's position and connect that change to specific new evidence. For Part 3, accept varied recommendations if the student clearly revises an initial response and gives a condition based on both pieces of evidence.