Whose Curb Space?

Read across three accounts of a proposed bus stop shelter.

11-12.RI.10.c "Read widely to understand diverse perspectives and viewpoints."

NAME _____ DATE _____

1 READ AND MARK

Read it twice

YOUR JOB Circle the writer or source in each paragraph, underline what that source wants or worries about, and number one concern each source leaves unresolved. Use your marks to compare the viewpoints.

A Shelter at the Stop

1. In a hypothetical town, the Route 8 stop outside a grocery store has no roof or bench. A petition written by bus riders asks the council to install both. One signer, who travels to an early hospital shift, describes waiting in rain while carrying a work bag. Another says standing for a long wait is painful. The petition treats the stop as more than a place to board: it is part of the trip, especially for people who cannot choose to drive. Because the writers focus on riders, they do not discuss where a shelter would fit on the narrow sidewalk.

2. A grocery owner answers in a letter to the local paper. She supports a bench but worries that a large shelter could block the store's loading entrance, where trucks make deliveries each morning. If trucks stopped farther down the street, she argues, workers might have to move heavy boxes through the crowded walkway. Her letter adds a view the petition leaves out: the space must serve deliveries as well as waiting passengers. Yet her solution, a bench without a roof, would not address the riders' concern about rain. Both writers value access, but they picture different people trying to use the same curb.

3. A town transportation planner's memo considers both accounts. It notes that any design must leave a clear path along the sidewalk for people using wheelchairs and must keep the loading entrance open. The planner suggests studying a narrower shelter placed beyond the entrance, along with a bench positioned outside the walking path. The memo does not promise that this layout will work; measurements and a maintenance budget are still needed. Reading the three texts together makes the issue harder to reduce to a vote for or against a shelter. Each writer notices a different use of limited public space.

2 ANSWER WITH EVIDENCE

Use the passage

1. How do the riders and the grocery owner differ in what they consider most important at the stop? Use a detail from each account.

2. What concern does the owner's letter add to the petition, and what concern does her proposed solution leave unresolved?

3. How does the planner's memo respond to both earlier accounts without settling the issue?

4. After reading all three accounts, why would a simple vote for or against a shelter miss part of the issue?

3 YOUR TURN

Your own words

Choose a different proposed change to a shared public place. In 80 to 110 words, explain how two groups might view it differently, name one source you would read to understand each view, and identify one question those sources might leave unanswered.

ANSWER KEY

Whose Curb Space?

HIGH SCHOOL · 11-12.RI.10.c

PART 1 · READ AND MARK

Circle the writer or source in each paragraph, underline what that source wants or worries about, and number one concern each source leaves unresolved. Use your marks to compare the viewpoints. Accept any marking that follows this job and points at the right text.

PART 2 · ANSWERS

#	QUESTION	ANSWER
1	How do the riders and the grocery owner differ in what they consider most important at the stop? Use a detail from each account.	**The riders emphasize protection from rain and a place to sit during long waits. The owner emphasizes keeping the loading entrance clear for deliveries, though she supports a bench.**
2	What concern does the owner's letter add to the petition, and what concern does her proposed solution leave unresolved?	**The letter adds the need for delivery access. A bench without a roof would still leave riders waiting in rain.**
3	How does the planner's memo respond to both earlier accounts without settling the issue?	**It suggests studying a narrower shelter beyond the loading entrance and a bench outside the walking path. Measurements and a maintenance budget are still needed.**
4	After reading all three accounts, why would a simple vote for or against a shelter miss part of the issue?	**A yes-or-no vote would not settle how to protect waiting riders while preserving delivery access and a clear path for people using wheelchairs.**

PART 3 · YOUR TURN (SAMPLE ANSWER)

A town is considering lights along a public park path. Evening walkers might welcome lights because they could see where they are stepping after sunset. I would read a neighborhood walking group's statement to understand which stretches feel difficult to use. People living beside the park might worry that bright lights will shine into bedroom windows. I would read their written comments to learn where that problem occurs. These sources could reveal different experiences of the same path, but they may not show which lighting designs limit glare while still making the path visible.

Accept other passage-supported comparisons that distinguish what each source notices or leaves out. For Part 3, look for two plausible perspectives, a relevant source for each, and an unanswered question.